TOWN OF ORANGETOWN ARCHITECTURE AND COMMUNITY APPEARANCE

BOARD OF REVIEW - MEETING OF OCTOBER 5, 2017

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Blythe Yost, Chair	Andrew Andrews
Brian Aitcheson	Shirley Goebel Christie
Deborah Stuhlweissenburg	Christopher Dunnigan

MEMBERS ABSENT: Brian Terry

ALSO PRESENT: Rick Pakola, Deputy Town Attorney; Ann Marie Ambrose, Stenographer and Cheryl Coopersmith, Chief Clerk

Blythe Yost, Chair, called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. Ms. Yost read the agenda. Hearings as listed on this meeting's agenda which are made a part of these minutes were held as noted below.

Continued Item from September 19, 2 8 Ryerson Place Plans Ryerson Place Subdivision Review of Structure, Site and Landscaping Plans 8 Ryerson Place, Tappan 77.14/1/8; R-15 zoning district	2017: Approved Subject to Conditions	ACABOR #17-41
<u>New Items</u> : Alterations 125 East Central Avenue Review of Window Repair Plans 125 East Central Avenue, Pearl River 68.16/6/44; CS zoning district	Approved as Presented	ACABOR #17-42
RRIS Corp Plans Review of Site, Structure, Landscaping Plans 1 Route 340, Orangeburg 74.11/2/26; CC zoning district	Approved Subject to Conditions	ACABOR #17-43
HNA Training Center Site Plan Review of Site, Structure, Landscaping Plans 334 Route 9W, Palisades 78.13/1/1; LO zoning district	Approved as Presented	ACABOR #17-44
Linen Choice Plans Review of Site, Structure, Landscaping Plans 57 North Troop Road/ Glenshaw Street, Orangeburg 70.18/2/17; LI zoning district	Rescheduled to November 16, 201 Meeting	ACABOR #17-45 7

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN ARCHITECTURE AND COMMUNITY APPEARANCE BOARD OF REVIEW - MEETING OF OCTOBER 5, 2017

Page 2 of 2

Other Business:

1. The Saloon in Pearl River requested a change in the façade materials and a discussion regarding the completion time of the project and granting of the Certificate of Occupancy; section 68.16, block 1, Lot 9, 45-49 West Central Avenue, Pearl River.

The applicant and Board determined that the façade materials would remain as approved under ACABOR #15-03, dated January 22, 2015 and as amended in ACABOR #17-25, dated June 22, 2017. In order to comply with conditions of ACABOR #15-03 and #17-25, the Board recommended to the Town of Orangetown Buildings Department that an extension in time to complete the improvements be granted until July 31, 2017.

2. A correction was made to Subaru Distributors LLC, ACABOR #17-35, dated September 7, 2017. The applicant stated that the addition would match the materials of the existing structure; façade and roof. Precast concrete panels with a white roof. The Decision will be corrected to reflect a white roof.

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting by Blythe Yost and seconded by Deborah Stuhlweissenburg and agreed by all in attendance. The Decisions on the above hearings, which Decisions are made by the Board before the conclusion of the meeting, are mailed to the applicant. The verbatim minutes are not transcribed, but are available. As there was no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

ACABOR #17-41: 8 Ryerson Place Plan Ryerson Place Subdivision Approved Subject to Conditions Site and Structure plans

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision October 5, 2017 Page 1 of 4

TO:Christine Brodsky, 350 Boxberger Road, Valley Cottage,
New York 10989FROM:Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review

RE: 8 Ryerson Place Plans: The application of Christine Brodsky, applicant, for the Estate of Anthony Zacharakis, owner, for the review of Structure, Landscaping and Site Plans at a site to be known as **"8 Ryerson Place Plans**" in the Ryerson Place Subdivision in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 8 Ryerson Place, Tappan, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 77.14, Block 1, Lot 8 in the R-15 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at meetings held **Tuesday, September 19 and Thursday, October 5, 2017**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Board Member Deborah Stuhlweissenburg recused herself from the proceedings of this item.

September 19, 2017

William Brodsky appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

A. Architectural Plans prepared by Barry Terach, R.A., dated June 13, 2017:

- A 3: Front and Rear Elevations
- A 4: Left and Right Elevations

B. Site Plan prepared by Jay Greenwell, PLS, dated June 29, 2017.

C. Landscaping plan.

D. Exterior Building Material Specification Sheet, signed by Christine Brodsky, undated.

E. A copy of the Building Permit Referral dated July 18, 2017 signed by Building Inspector Dave Majewski.

F. Project Narrative.

ACABOR #17-41: 8 Ryerson Place Site/Structure Plans Permit #46668 Ryerson Place Subdivision Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision October 5, 2017 Page 2 of 4

FINDINGS OF FACT:

- 1. The Board found that the proposed house would have four sides of vinyl siding with decorative bricks and stonework. The vinyl siding would be manufactured by CertainTeed Mainstreet in Granite Gray siding, or equal. Brick would be manufactured by McNear Brick & Block Company in Stratford style, or equal, and the stone would be Pennsylvania Fieldstone manufactured by El Dorado, or equal. The roof would be Charcoal, manufactured by Timberline, or equal, the trim color would be Sterling Gray, manufactured by Certainteed, or equal and the window shutters would be Mastic Dark Brown, manufactured by Plygem, or equal.
- 2. The Board found the landscaping plan to be acceptable, however, the air conditioning unit to be placed behind the fireplace needed to be screened with evergreen plantings. The applicant offered to plant Boxwoods around the unit.
- **3.** The Board found that the proposed house appeared similar to two other houses proposed on adjacent lots and reviewed the plans for possible façade changes.

The applicant requested a **CONTINUATION**.

October 5, 2017

William Brodsky appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

A. Architectural Plans prepared by Barry Terach, R.A., dated June 13, 2017:

• A - 3: Elevations

FINDINGS OF FACT:

- 1. The Board found that the proposed house elevations were redesigned and the house appeared significantly different than the abutting houses.
- **2.** The Board found that the following changes had been made to the house façade:
 - a. Roof line was changed from a hip roof to a gable roof,
 - b. Windows shapes, and
 - c. Garage door frame and door changed to an arch.

Permit #46668

ACABOR #17-41: 8 Ryerson Place Plan Ryerson Place Subdivision Approved Subject to Conditions Site and Structure plans

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision October 5, 2017 Page 3 of 4

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved Subject to the Following Conditions**:

- The proposed house will have four sides of vinyl siding with decorative bricks and stonework. The vinyl siding would be manufactured by CertainTeed Mainstreet in Granite Gray siding, or equal. Brick would be manufactured by McNear Brick & Block Company in Stratford style, or equal, and the stone would be Pennsylvania Fieldstone manufactured by El Dorado, or equal. The roof would be Charcoal, manufactured by Timberline, or equal, the trim color would be Sterling Gray, manufactured by Certainteed, or equal and the window shutters would be Mastic Dark Brown, manufactured by Plygem, or equal.
- 2. The air conditioning unit shall be placed behind the fireplace and be screened with evergreen plantings. The applicant offered to plant Boxwoods around the unit.
- **3.** The house siding shall be brought down to 8 inches above grade, on all four sides of the house.
- **4.** Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.
- **5.** No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.
- **6.** The applicant shall comply with the requirements of Section 21-25 of the Town of Orangetown Shade Tree Ordinance.
- 7. Lighting will be in accordance with Town of Orangetown Town code.

Permit #46668

ACABOR #17-41: 8 Ryerson Place Plan Ryerson Place Subdivision Approved Subject to Conditions Site and Structure plans

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision October 5, 2017 Page 4 of 4

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Brian Aitcheson and seconded by Brian Terry and carried as follows: Blythe Yost, Chair, aye; Andrew Andrews, aye; Brian Terry, absent; Christopher Dunnigan, aye; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye, and Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, recused.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

ACABOR #17-42: Alterations 125 East Central Avenue Permit #46795 Window Repair Plan - Approved as Presented

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision October 5, 2017 Page 1 of 2

TO:Donald Brenner, 4 Independence Avenue, Tappan, New YorkFROM:Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: Alterations 125 East Central Avenue Plans: The application of Andrew Asgar, owner, for the review of a Window Repair Plan at a site known to be known as "Alterations 125 East Central Avenue Plans" in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 125 East Central Avenue, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 68.16, Block 6, Lot 44 in the CS zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, October 5, 2017**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Donald Brenner and Andrew Asgar appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

A. Architectural Plan prepared by Michael Esmay, RA, dated August 18, 2017; entitled Alteration to an Existing Commercial Building at 125 East Central Avenue, Pearl River, NY.

B. Exterior Building Material Specifications dated August 31, 2017; with an addendum entitled Exterior Finishes for 125 East Central Avenue.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

- 1. The Board found that the existing structure is in need of repair and the applicant proposed to repair existing windows and install new inserts. In addition, a new entry door would be placed on the structure. The existing roof would be repaired with shingles to match the existing shingles. The existing stucco is to remain and patched to match as required. The stucco would be painted with masonry paint in a light gray, Provident Blue, manufactured by Benjamin Moore, or equal. The Board gave the applicant the option of selecting an alternative color for the structure; Ba Ha Dunes (tan/beige color).
- 2. The Board found that the stained gothic windows would remain and would be repaired as required. The exterior trim would be wrapped with aluminum casing with insulated glass and the color would be white. The existing double hung windows would be removed and replaced with double hung windows to match. The window frames would be white. One new window would be provided on the North side of the structure, which would be vinyl clad wood casement window, manufactured by Anderson Windows, or equal, in the color white, all window repairs are as noted on the submitted plan.

ACABOR #17-42: Alterations 125 East Central Avenue Permit #46795 Window Repair Plan - Approved as Presented

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision October 5, 2017 Page 2 of 2

- **3.** The Board found that the existing doors would be removed and replaced by fiberglass doors, manufactured by Taylor Entrance Systems, or equal. The doors would have a brown wood grain finish. The existing wood attic and tower vents are to remain and would be painted white. The existing natural river stone base is to remain as is and patched to match as required.
- **4.** The Board found that the existing light fixtures would remain.

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved as Presented.**

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Shirley Goebel Christie and seconded Brian Aitcheson and carried as follows: Blythe Yost, Chair, aye; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Brian Terry, absent; Christopher Dunnigan, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye; Andrew Andrews, aye and Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

ACABOR #17-43: RRIS Corp Plans: Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

October 5, 2017 Page 1 of 3

TO:Donald Brenner, 4 Independence Avenue, Tappan, New YorkFROM:Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board
of Review

RE: RRIS Corp. Site Plan: The application of Paul Adler, owner, for the review of Site/Structure Plans at a site known to be known as "**RRIS Corp. Site Plan**", in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 1 Route 340, Orangeburg, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 74.11, Block 2, Lot 26 in the CC zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, October 5, 2017**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Donald Brenner, Kier Leveque and Jesse Cokeley appeared and testified. The Board received the following items:

A. Site Plans entitled RISS Corporation Preliminary Major Site Plan, prepared by Jesse Cokeley, Maser Consulting, dated June 6, 2017, last revision date of August 3, 2017:

- Sheet 1 of 9: Cover Sheet
- Sheet 2 of 9: Project Notes
- Sheet 3 of 9: Demolition Plan
- Sheet 4 of 9: Layout Plan
- Sheet 6 of 9: Soil, Erosion & Sediment Control Plan
- Sheet 7 of 9: Construction Details

B. Architectural Plans prepared by Kier Levesque, R.A., A-2:

• Front Elevation and 1st Floor Plan

C. Project Narrative prepared by Maser Consulting dated August 11, 2017, signed by Jesse Cokeley, P.E., Project Manager.

D. Existing Conditions Memorandum prepared by Maser Consulting dated August 9, 2017.

E. A copy of PB#16-36, Preliminary Site Plan Approval Subject to Conditions, Neg. Dec., dated July 26, 2017.

F. A Building permit referral from Rick Oliver dated March 8, 2016.

ACABOR #17-43: RRIS Corp Plans: Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

October 5, 2017 Page 2 of 3

FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The Board found that the proposed development consisted of a one story, 12,000 square foot structure divided into 4 separate retail/service areas with accessory storage. Each of the 4 tenants will have approximately 750 square feet of space and 2,250 of storage space. A parking lot will also be providing with a total of 19 spaces, including 1 space for handicapped parking.
- 2. The Board found that the structure would have a façade consisting of Concrete Masonry Unit Wall, or equal, on the lower half, and metal siding on the upper half, as noted on the submitted plan.
- **3.** The Board found that the landscaping plan noted the loss of 4 trees during construction. The Board recommended additional landscaping on the southern edge of the property line.
- **4.** The Board found that the building would be constructed 5 feet from the property line which may impact additional trees to be lost after construction is completed. The applicant should consider replanting trees to replenish any lost trees.

The hearing was then opened to the Public.

Public Comment:

Joseph D'Auiria, 3 & 1 Route 340, Orangeburg; raised concerns regarding screening along the shared property line and the impact of the removal of trees from the project site.

Mary Cardanus, Town of Orangetown Town Historian, 66 Pine Tree Lane, Tappan; discussed the placement of a plaque on the building commemorating Gus Wilson, boxing legend who had a gym at this location.

There being no one else to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved Subject to the Following Conditions**:

- 1. The Site Plan shall be revised to straighten the line of the south parking lot so that it is parallel with the property line, thereby creating a pocket enabling the planting of 3 deciduous trees. The Landscaping and Site Plans shall be revised.
- 2. The structure will have a façade consisting of Concrete Masonry Unit Wall, or equal, on the lower half, and metal siding on the upper half, as noted on the submitted plan.

ACABOR #17-43: RRIS Corp Plans: Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

October 5, 2017 Page 3 of 3

- **3.** As part of Orangetown history a commemorative plaque shall be on the site noting that it was the location of "Gus Wilson's Prize Fighting Training Camp." The Board and applicant agreed that the plaque should be placed on the building. The applicant shall contact Mary Cardenas, Museum Director of the Orangetown Historical Museum & Archives, for additional information. A note shall be placed on the Architectural Plans and the Site Plans, referring to this condition of a commemorative plaque on the building façade.
- **4.** Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.
- **5.** No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Deborah Stuhlweissenburg and seconded by Shirley Goebel Christie and carried as follows: Blythe Yost, Chair, aye; Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, aye; Brian Terry, absent; Andrew Andrews, aye; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye, Christopher Dunnigan, aye, and Brian Aitcheson, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

ACABOR #17-44: HNA Training Center Site Plan Permit #46550 Approved as Presented

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision October 5, 2017 Page 1 of 2

TO: Brian Quinn, 67 North Main Street, P.O. Box 1070, New City, New York, 10956

FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: HNA Training Center Site Plan: The application of HNA Training Center NY, LLC, owner, for the review Structure, Landscaping and Site Plans a site to be known as "**HNA Training Center Site Plan**", in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 334 Route 9W, Palisades, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 78.13, Block 1, Lot 1 in the LO zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday**, **October 5**, **2017**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Shawn Kelsey, Brian Quinn and Jessey Cokeley appeared and testified. The Board received the following items:

A. Preliminary Site Plans, prepared by Maser Consulting, dated June 7, 2017, last revision date of August 3, 2017:

- Sheet 1 of 11: Cover Sheet
- Sheet 2 of 11: Project Notes
- Sheet 3 of 11: Overall Layout Plan
- Sheet 4 of 11: Building Layout Plan
- Sheet 5 of 11: Parking Layout Plan
- Sheet 8 of 11: Landscape Plan & Details

B. Architectural Plans prepared by Thomas Hamilton & Associates, dated July 6, 2017:

- Sheet A-1: Proposed Guestroom Addition 1st & 2nd Floor Plans
- Sheet A-2: Proposed Guestroom Addition 3rd & 4th Floor Plans
- Sheet A-3: Proposed Guestroom Addition 5th Floor Plan
- Sheet A-4: Proposed Guestroom Building Exterior Elevations

C. Tree Removal Plan prepared by Maser Consulting, Preliminary Site Plan, dated August 10, 2017.

D. Project Narrative prepared by Maser Consulting dated August 11, 2017, signed by Jesse Cokeley, P.E., Project Manager.

E. Existing Conditions Memorandum prepared by Maser Consulting dated August 9, 2017.

F. Specification sheets for Bollards, manufactured by Prisma Architectural and LED Lensed Downlight-Glass GenV, manufactured by Vantage.

ACABOR #17-44: HNA Training Center Site Plan Permit #46550 Approved as Presented

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision October 5, 2017 Page 2 of 2

G. A copy of PB#16-39, Preliminary Site Plan Approval Subject to Conditions, Neg. Dec., dated July 26, 2017.

H. Material Specification Sheet signed by Jesse Cokeley, dated August 11, 2017.

I. Building Permit Referral dated June 8, 2017, signed by Rick Oliver, Building Inspector.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

- 1. The Board found that the proposed development consisted of a five story structure, an expansion to the existing training facility on site. The proposed expansion will match the existing building façade in appearance and architecture.
- 2. The Board found that the proposed building expansion would have a brick masonry façade to match the exiting building. The brick would be Glen-Gery in Danish Blend, or equal. The size of the brick would match the existing brick and the mortar joint would match the brick height and color of existing mortar. The windows would be manufactured by Duratherm Window Corporation, or equal and the frame would be wood. The walkways would be bluestone pavers to match the existing on site. The roof would be lite grey or gunmetal to match the existing roof.
- **3.** The Board found that the exterior air conditioning units would be placed on the roof and screened.
- 4. The Board found that the exterior lighting consisted of 4 6" LED lensed down lights evenly spaced in the ceiling of the bridge that connects the addition to the existing building, manufactured by Vantage, or equal.
- 5. The Board found that the applicant proposed to place 3 bollard lighting, as noted on the site plan, manufactured by Prisma, or equal.
- 6. The Board found the landscaping plan to be acceptable

The hearing was then opened to the Public. There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved as Presented.**

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Andrew Andrews and seconded by Blythe Yost and carried as follows: Blythe Yost, Chair, aye; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Brian Terry, absent; Christopher Dunnigan, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye; Andrew Andrews, aye, and Deborah Stuhlweissenburg aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.