

**TOWN OF ORANGETOWN ARCHITECTURE AND COMMUNITY APPEARANCE
BOARD OF REVIEW - MEETING OF July 20, 2017**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Blythe Yost, Chair
Andrew Andrews Brian Terry
Brian Aitcheson Shirley Goebel Christie
Christopher Dunnigan

MEMBER ABSENT: Deborah Stuhlweissenburg

ALSO PRESENT: Rick Pakola, Deputy Town Attorney; Ann Marie Ambrose, Stenographer and Cheryl Coopersmith, Chief Clerk

Blythe Yost, Chair called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.
Ms Yost read the agenda. Hearings as listed on this meeting's agenda which are made a part of these minutes were held as noted below.

New Items:

Ehrhardt Road Plans **ACABOR #17-31**
Hanson Subdivision – Lot #2 **Approved Subject**
Review of Site/ Structure and **to Conditions**
Landscaping Plans
242 Ehrhardt Road, Pearl River
69.05/4/45.2; R-15 zoning district

Hawks View Subdivision – Lot #1 **ACABOR #17-32**
Critical Environmental Area **Approved Subject**
Review of Site/ Structure **to Conditions**
and Landscaping Plans
290/298 South Boulevard, Upper Grandview
71.05/1/22.4; R-22 zoning district

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting by Christopher Dunnigan and seconded by Brian Terry and agreed by all in attendance. The Decisions on the above hearings, which Decisions are made by the Board before the conclusion of the meeting, are mailed to the applicant. The verbatim minutes are not transcribed, but are available. As there was no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 9:00 p.m. The next ACABOR Meeting is scheduled for September 7, 2017.

Dated: July 20, 2017
Cheryl Coopersmith
Chief Clerk Boards and Commissions



July 20, 2017

Page 1 of 4

TO: Donald Brenner, P.E., LL.B, 4 Independence Ave., Tappan, , New York 10983

FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: **Ehrhardt Road Plans – Hanson Subdivision Lot #2:** The application of Tri-Bee Ltd., owner, for the review of Structure, Site and Landscaping Plans, at a site to be known as “**Ehrhardt Road Plans - Hanson Subdivision Lot #2**”, in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 242 Ehrhardt Road, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 69.05, Block 4, Lot 45.2; in the R-15 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, July 20, 2017**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Blythe Yost, Chair, recused herself from the proceedings of this item.

Donald Brenner and Thomas Bertussi appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

A. Site Plan prepared by Sparaco & Youngblood, PLLC, dated June 7, 2017, last revised June 19, 2017.

B. Architectural Plans prepared by Albert Dattoli, R.A., dated November 14, 2014

A-1. of 5: Elevations

A-2. of 5: Elevations

A-3 of 5: Basement/Foundation and Wall Section

A-4 of 5: First Floor Plan and Handrail/Guard Detail

A-5 of 5: Second Floor Plan and Roof Framing Plan

E-1: Basement Electric Plan

E-2: First Floor Electric Plan

E-3: Second Floor Electric Plan

C. Landscaping Plan prepared by Yost Design Landscape Architecture, dated June 2, 2017.

D. Material Specifications signed by Thomas Bertussi undated.



July 20, 2017

Page 2 of 4

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the applicant had previously appeared before ACABOR in 2007 and obtained approval for a similar house on this lot. The current proposed house would have four sides of vinyl siding. The Board gave the applicant the option of adding decorative stonework under the porch and along the foundation. If stone is selected, the plans would be revised and submitted to the ACABOR Office for re-stamping. The vinyl siding would be brushed clapboard, in Heritage cream color, manufactured by Certainteed, or equal. The stonework, if selected, would be manufactured by Stonecraft Industries in Laurel Cavern Ledge, in Chardonay, or equal. The roof would be Weathered Wood, manufactured by Timberline, or equal. Shutters would be brown in color and are optional. The garage doors would be white.
2. The Board found that lighting would be placed by the exterior doorways, in accordance with Town Code.
3. The Board found that the applicant is asking for a 12 foot wide driveway with a 3 foot separation between the driveway and the property line. However, under the 1999 Subdivision, the plan called for a 10 foot wide driveway with a 5 foot separation to the property line. The Board believed that cars are bigger now than 17 years ago and a 10 foot wide driveway would be very difficult to navigate, raising safety issues for both the driver and pedestrians. The Board held that a 5 foot separation was not possible and decreased it to a 3 foot separation, providing for a 12 foot driveway.
4. The Board found the landscaping plan to be acceptable, however the plan shall be revised to reflect the change in landscaping along the driveway. The Board discussed the plantings proposed for the entire length of the driveway to be located in the three foot separation between the driveway and the property line, recommending Miscantus Morning light, an ornamental grass. The Board held that it would be inappropriate to plant woody trees/ shrubs in the three foot strip of land along the driveway; given the narrowness of the area, any shrubs or trees in proximity to the driveway would not survive snow removal in the winter.
5. The Board found that air conditioning units would be located at the Southeast corner of the house.

Public Comment:

Pat Byrne, 252 Ehrhardt Road, Pearl River, expressed concerns regarding the plantings between his property and the applicants, noting the prior decision, ACABOR #07-54. He raised concerns of safety and headlights shining onto his property.



Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision

July 20, 2017
Page 3 of 4

There being no one else to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved Subject to the Following Conditions:**

1. The proposed house will have four sides of vinyl siding. The applicant has the option of adding decorative stonework under the porch and along the foundation. If stone is selected, the plans will be revised and submitted to the ACABOR Office for re-stamping. The vinyl siding will be brushed clapboard, in Heritage cream color, manufactured by Certainteed, or equal. The stonework, if selected, will be manufactured by Stonecraft Industries in Laurel Cavern Ledge, in Chardonay, or equal. The roof will be Weathered Wood, manufactured by Timberline, or equal. Shutters will be brown in color and are optional. The garage doors will be white.
2. The lighting will be placed by the exterior doorways, in accordance with Town Code.
3. The air conditioning units will be located at the Southeast corner of the house.
4. Miscantus Morning light, an ornamental grass, shall be planted along the entire length of the driveway in the three foot separation between the driveway and the property line. The Landscaping Plan shall be revised.
5. The Board determined that a 12 foot wide driveway with a 3 foot separation between the driveway and the property line was acceptable for safe navigation of the driveway for drivers and pedestrians. The Board believed that cars are bigger now than 17 years ago and a 10 foot wide driveway would be very unsafe. The Board held that it would be inappropriate to plant woody trees/ shrubs in the three foot strip of land along the driveway; given the narrowness of the area, any shrubs or trees in proximity to the driveway would not survive snow removal in the winter.
6. Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.



Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision

July 20, 2017

Page 4 of 4

7. No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.

9. The applicant shall comply with the requirements of Section 21-25 of the Town of Orangetown Shade Tree Ordinance.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Brian Terry and seconded by Christopher Dunnigan and carried as follows: Blythe Yost, Chair, recused; Andrew Andrews, aye; Brian Terry, aye; Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, absent; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Christopher Dunnigan, aye and Brian Aitcheson, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: July 20, 2017

Cheryl Coopersmith

Chief Clerk Boards and Commissions



ACABOR #17-32:

Permit #46563

Hawks View Estates Subdivision Lot #1

Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown

Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 20, 2017

Page 1 of 3

TO: Sean Keenan, 24 Waters, Congers, New York 10920
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: **Hawks View Estates Subdivision – Lot #1:** The application of SMK Homes Builders, Inc., owner, for the review of Structure, Landscaping and Site Plans, at a site to be known as “**Hawks View Estates Subdivision – Lot #1**”, located in the Critical Environmental Area, in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 290/298 South Boulevard, Upper Grandview, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 71.05, Block 1, Lot 22.4; in the R-22 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, July 20, 2017**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Sean Keenan and Robert Hoene appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

- A.** Site Plan prepared by Jay Greenwell, PLS dated June 5, 2017, revised June 26, 2017.
- B.** Architectural Plans prepared by Robert Hoene, RA, dated March 5, 2013, last revision date of July 7, 2017:
 - 1 of 4: Front & Rear Elevations
 - 2 of 4: Rear and Left Elevations
 - 3 of 4: First Floor Plan
 - 4 of 4: Second Floor Plan
- C.** Landscaping Plan by SMK Home Builders, dated June 2017.
- D.** Exterior Building Material Specifications, Sean Keenan dated July 7, 2017.
- E.** Building Permit Referral signed by Rick Oliver, Building Inspector, dated June 28, 2017.



ACABOR #17-32:

Permit #46563

Hawks View Estates Subdivision Lot #1

Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown

Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 20, 2017

Page 2 of 3

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the proposed house would have four sides of Hardi Board shakes siding, or equal, with decorative stonework along the house foundation, as noted on the submitted plans. The color of the Hardi Board shakes would be Faux Slate (gray), or equal. The decorative stone would be cultured stone or natural stone, in southern ledge stone and fieldstone in Fog color (grey tones), or equal. The roof shingles would be Pewter Grey manufactured by Timberline, or equal. The applicant requested an option of using faux slate for the roof, if the budget allowed, the Board agreed.
2. The Board found that the trim would be Azek, or equal, in white or a shade of grey. The front entryway stoop would be bluestone and the front door would be a 5 foot wide by 9 foot high pivot glass door.
3. The Board found that the air conditioning units would be located behind the garage, near the back corner and should be appropriately screened. The Landscaping Plan should be revised to note the location of the air conditioning units and screening.
4. The Board found that lighting would be placed by the exterior doorways, in accordance with Town Code.

There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **Approved Subject to the Following Conditions:**

1. The proposed house will have four sides of Hardi Board shakes siding, or equal, with decorative stonework on the along the house foundation, as noted on the submitted plans. The color of the Hardi Board shakes will be Faux Slate (gray), or equal. The decorative stone will be cultured stone or natural stone, in southern ledge stone and fieldstone in Fog color (grey tones), or equal. The roof shingles will be Pewter Grey manufactured by Timberline, or equal. The Board gave the applicant the option of using faux slate for the roof, if the budget allowed. The house trim will be Azek, or equal, in white or a shade of grey, the front entryway stoop will be bluestone and the front door will be a 5 foot wide by 9 foot high pivot glass door.



ACABOR #17-32:

Permit #46563

Hawks View Estates Subdivision Lot #1

Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown

Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 20, 2017

Page 3 of 3

2. The air conditioning units will be located behind the garage, near the back corner and shall be appropriately screened. The Landscaping Plan shall be revised to note the location of the air conditioning units and screening.
3. Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.
4. No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.
5. The applicant shall comply with the requirements of Section 21-25 of the Town of Orangetown Shade Tree Ordinance.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Shirley Goebel Christie and seconded Andrew Andrews and carried as follows: Blythe Yost, Chair, aye; Shirley Goebel Christie, aye; Brian Terry, aye; Brian Aitcheson, aye; Andrew Andrews, aye; Deborah Stuhlweissenburg, absent and Christopher Dunnigan, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this **Decision** and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: July 20, 2017

Cheryl Coopersmith

Chief Clerk Boards and Commissions

