

**MINUTES
HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
July 8, 2025**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Scott Wheatley, Chair
 Loren Plotkin
 William Walther
 Thano Schoppel
 Marjorie Galen

ABSENT: None

ALSO, PRESENT: Stefanie Schera, Deputy Town Attorney
 Anne Marie Ambrose, Official Stenographer
 Katlyn Bettmann, Administrative Aide

Margaret Raso, Chair, called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. Hearings on this meeting's agenda, which are made a part of this meeting, were held as noted below:

<u>APPLICANTS</u>	<u>DECISION</u>	<u>HABR#</u>
<u>CONTINUED ITEM:</u>		
TOLEDO 116 Greenbush Road Tappan, New York 77.10 / 2 / 19; R-15 zone	APPROVED AS MODIFIED. AT THE JULY 8, 2025 MEETING	HABR#25-02
<u>NEW ITEMS:</u>		
NEIRA 2 Hauser Terrace Tappan, New York 77.11 / 1 / 8.2; R-15 zone	APPROVED WITH A CONDITION	HABR#25-03
PALISADES FREE LIBRARY 19 Closter Road Palisades, New York 78.17 / 2 / 22; R-40 zone	APPROVED AS PRESENTED	HABR#25-04

THE DECISIONS RELATED TO THE ABOVE HEARINGS are inserted herein and made part of these minutes.

There being no further business to come before the Board, on motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 9:00 P.M.

DATED: July 8, 2025

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW

BY: 
Katlyn Bettmann
Administrative Aide

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2025 JUL 28 P 2:41
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

DECISION

APPROVED AS MODIFIED AT THE JULY 8, 2025 HABR MEETING.

TO: Jonathan Hodosh(Toledo)
120 North Main Street
Suite 501
Tappan, NY 10983

HABR#25-02
June 10, 2025 & July 8, 2025
Permit # BLDR-6780-25

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#25-02: Application of Justine Toledo, for a review of a additions and alterations at an existing single-family residence at 116 Greenbush Road, Tappan, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4 (E), Historical Areas Board of Review.
Tax Map Designation: 77.10 / 2 / 19; R-15 zone

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, June 10, 2025 and July 8, 2025 at which time the Board made the following determination:

At the meeting of June 10, 2025 Jonathan Hodosh, Architect, Justine Toledo and Xavier Camillo, Homeowners, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. Architectural Plans, with the most recent revision date of April 23, 2025 signed by Jonathan Hodosh, R.A., (9 pages).
2. A letter giving Jonathan B. Hodosh, Architect, authorization to represent the Owners as their Agent for this project, notarized April 14, 2025.
3. A narrative summary dated April 25, 2025.
4. Computer generated renderings submitted at the HABR meeting of June 10, 2025, (6 pages).

Loren Plotkin asked if the Notice of Hearing posters had been posted on the property?

Justine Toledo, Homeowner stated that she believed the Architect's office would be posting them.

Jonathan Hodosh, Architect, stated that he was under the impression that the Homeowner was going to be posting the posters.

Scott Wheatly, Chairman, stated that the application could be heard and continue to the July meeting in order to make their decision; that previously if they heard an application that had not posted their property on time, they permitted the applicants to post the property immediately thereafter, and made the decision with the with the understanding that if there were to be any neighbors to come forward with a complaint in a specific amount of time, then the applicants would need to come back.

Stefanie Schera, Deputy Town Attorney, stated theoretically a neighbor can have observation relative to the Boards consideration, and that ultimately it is up the Board how they would like to handle the situation; that in her opinion they should hold off on deliberating this project for another time;

Jonathan Hodosh, stated that he would like the application to be hear this evening and get the Boards feedback on the project.

Thano Schoppel stated that this application should be heard as a consultation.

Stefanie Schera stated that this would be the best scenario, for the application to be heard as a consultation; that the applicants could then come back for the Boards deliberation and to make their decision, at the July 8, 2025 meeting.

Jonathan Hodosh, stated that the home is an existing high ranch; that the home is a bit dated; that the windows are old and the siding is weathered; they are looking to expand the house; that the addition, with the exception of the front, is completely in the rear of the home; that in the front of the house they are expanding and would like to create a foyer and some closets and a nicer entryway; that because of the cantilever and because they are in the Historic zone they felt that the Garrison was the closest in style, a simple gable roof, with a cantilever in the front; that this a simple structure, a front to back gable with a front portico;

that the materials are very straight forward; that the roof is slate, per the listing provided, that the siding will be vinyl CertainTeed brand in Greystone color which is a light grey per the list provided and that is on the whole house; that the windows would be black frame windows with white trim; that the doors will be Thermatru brand simple panel doors as pictured in the sheets he has given out to the Board; that the lighting will be dusk to dawn, and outdoor lanterns, as pictured on the same sheets provided; that the lights will be on a switch that can be overridden; that there is a deck in the back and the deck will be stained to match the house with white railings; that he misspoke it is actually a black railing; that in the rest of the neighborhood there are a variety of homes; that this is in keeping with the neighborhood surrounding that area; that there are also an abundance of trees in this area; that there is one house in the neighborhood that is different from them all, however this house is fitting to the neighborhood; that these are very simple houses with very simple gables;

Chairman Wheatley asked what is going to be inside of the two-story addition?

Jonathan Hodosh responded that the bottom level of the home would be garage storage, a bedroom, a utility room or a family room or storage room; that the second floor would be three bedrooms, and a great room area; that it would become a larger plan what exists; that the first floor is a typical high ranch, with no bedroom, a family room, a garage, and a bathroom; that the existing second floor is three bedrooms, a kitchen, a living room, and a dining room which is your typical high ranch; that the proposed lower level will have half of the garage becoming storage, a laundry room, a utility room, a bathroom which is an ensuite to the guest bedroom, a powder room, and a small family room; that upstairs will become the great room off the kitchen once expanded in the rear, and will have two bedrooms and the master suite; that the master suite will have a large closet and its own bathroom; that the other bedrooms will share a bathroom in the hallway;

Loren Plotkin asked if there were to be changes made to the driveway?

Jonathan Hodosh responded that they had discussed possibly changing to a circular driveway however they decided not to complicate the project and leave the driveway without changes for this proposal;

William Walther asked what will the material of the siding be?

Jonathan Hodosh responded that the siding will be the CertainTeed brand vinyl siding;

William Walther also stated that it is unfortunate that the drawings do not show the true colors of the house; that the siding is more appealing than the peachy color that is implied on the prints;

Jonathan Hodosh responded that it is difficult to have the printer make them true to color;

William Walther also stated that there is an elevation view that is absent of any windows, and what was the thought there? He also stated that on the other side elevation, the mass of the surface is broken up with windows; that he was wondering if that could be introduced into this elevation as well.

Jonathan Hodosh responded that this elevation has the lack of windows because they wanted to provide more wall space in this room; that this room in the front has an existing brick fire place; that they can look at the plans and add windows, it is not an issue;

Chairman Wheatley stated that this is the North elevation.

William Walther stated that it is a lot of surface to be without windows, and being the North side, it is a much better light, a much softer light than the South side; that he would appreciate if more interest we taken into this façade; that they would benefit from this because of the North light exposure, that it's a pleasure to soak in; that however he has no issue with the materials themselves that are being used.

Jonathan Hodosh asked to be continued to the July 8, 2025 Historic Board meeting.

TOWN OF BRANFLOREN
JUL 28 P 2:41

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

At the meeting of July 8, 2025 Jonathan Hodosh, Architect, and Shanice Bernard, Designer, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

5. Computer generated renderings submitted at the HABR meeting of July 8, 2025, (6 pages).

Jonathan Hodosh, Architect, stated that at the previous meeting the Board requested that there be windows added to the North side of the house; that they made changes and added windows where they could; that they could not add windows in some locations due to the location of the fireplace and chimney; that they also have used a better printed for color renderings to show accurate colors; that the proposal will be four (4') feet higher than what is currently existing;

Thano Schoppel, in response to a resident's concerns regarding the changing of the historical aesthetic of the area, discussed more fully below, stated that the Historic District in Tappan is not Williamsburg; that this Board has a different purpose; that we have to preserve and maintain the aspect; that within the District because of the process through the centuries there are houses built from the 1700's and houses built up to recently; that the purpose of the District and the Board is not to make everything look Colonial or old fashioned or what have you; that the Board tries to make everything look in sync, in some way, with what's relative; that there are plenty of houses is the Historic District of Tappan that looked like this before the Historic District was created; that they are there to make sure that it harmonizes; that he thinks this would be approached by the Historical Society; that after purchasing his home in the Historic District the Historical Society knocked on the door of their home and explained the guidelines of the area; and that he gives guided walking tours of the Historic District; that the Manse Barn, the original building was a Dutch Colonial; that the Victorian porch was added in the 19th Century; that this may have been jarring to the people in the 19th Century, however to us now it looks very beautiful; that this a part of the revolution of homes, in that context.

Scott Wheatly, Chairman, asked if this project was referred to any other Land use Boards? To which the answer was no.

Scott Wheatly also stated that this house is already existing; that this application is for a rear addition and a portico in the front, and that the applicants are using earth tone colors.

Stefanie Schera, Deputy Town Attorney, in response to a resident's concerns regarding the changing of the historical aesthetic of the area, discussed more fully below, stated that the Historic Board is limited to certain criteria that is set forth in the Town of Orangetown Town Code, under Chapter 18; that some of the questions that are being asked are more appropriate for other forums and other possible applications; that these are things that would have to be overseen by the Building Department to ensure that the Homeowners are acting in accordance with the Town Code; that the Historic Board is charged with the assessment as to whether or not the changes are consistent and harmonious with the surrounding area in the Historical District; that this would be why one of the Board members has properly indicated, that some of the questions being posed would not be relevant specifically for this Boards consideration.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Chris Cardona 128 Greenbush Road, Tappan, New York, stated that he has been through this process himself a few times; that the lot is a Historical piece of Tappan and was once part of the Dutch Reformed Church, as well as part of the lot that his home belonged to; that he wanted to know how the roof peak height would be changing from the existing; that he would like to know what type of grading and excavation will be done between their two lots and if there was to be a landscape design; that he wanted to know the distance between his home and this addition; that he was wondering if they had considered a less modern style casing or window style; that he was wondering if the patio is also being taken into consideration;

Christina Wooden, 101 Greenbush Road, Tappan, New York, stated that she lives across from this property in an 1860's home; that she attended the previously HABR meeting as well; that the Architect is referencing a Garrison style home, which feels popular in the Revolutionary War era; that she was hoping that there would be a nod to that era made in this proposal; that the homeowner should be made aware of the history and the debt to the area; that it would be lovely for them to fall in love with the detail to the plan; that they love Greenbush Road and it has a very nice feel to it; that she feels that this addition makes the home look entirely different.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing same, found as fact, that:

The application as presented for the amendment would not adversely affect the Historic District and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed in Architectural Plans, with the most recent revision date of April 23, 2025 signed by Jonathan Hodosh, R.A., (9 pages), the narrative summary dated April 25, 2025, and computer generated renderings submitted at the HABR meeting of July 8, 2025, (6 pages).are complimentary to the District.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application (Architectural Plans, with the most recent revision date of April 23, 2025 signed by Jonathan Hodosh, R.A., (9 pages), the narrative summary dated April 25, 2025, and computer-generated renderings submitted at the HABR meeting of July 8, 2025, (6 pages).are complimentary to the District.) is APPROVED as submitted and presented with the following conditions:

1. The Roof shingles shall be GAF Timberline HDZ Color Charcoal.
2. The House shall be sided in CertainTeed Monogram Vinyl Siding Double 4" Rough Cedar Finish (Graystone Color).
3. The Soffits and Fascia shall be White aluminum Tri-Built
4. The Windows shall be Andersen 400 series, in black vinyl.
5. The Trim shall be Vinyl CertainTeed (Graystone).
6. The Front and Side doors shall be Therma-Tru fiberglass, in black.
7. The Garage door shall be Clopay Classic, in black steel.
8. The Back door shall be Andersen 200 Series, in black wood/vinyl.
9. The Exterior wall sconce shall be black metal from the home Decorators collection.
10. The flood light shall be by Defiant, in black metal.

THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.

***** PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2025 JUL 28 P 2:42
TOWN OF ORANGE TOWN

- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT , CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), Architectural Plans, with the most recent revision date of April 23, 2025 signed by Jonathan Hodosh, R.A., (9 pages), the narrative summary dated April 25, 2025, and computer generated renderings submitted at the HABR meeting of July 8, 2025, (6 pages).are complimentary to the District.; is APPROVED AS MODIFIED AT THE JULY 8, 2025 HABR MEETING.

The foregoing resolution to approve the Architectural Plans, with the most recent revision date of April 23, 2025 signed by Jonathan Hodosh, R.A., (9 pages), the narrative summary dated April 25, 2025, and computer generated renderings submitted at the HABR meeting of July 8, 2025, (6 pages).are complimentary to the District., as submitted, with the following condition: prior approval of the Historical Area Board of Review is required prior to any change or modification or the requirements and/or conditions set forth in this Decision; was presented and moved by William Walter, seconded by Thano Schoppel and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Marjorie Galen, aye; Loren Plotkin, aye; William Walter, aye; and Chairman Wheatley, aye.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: July 8, 2025

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY: -  _____
Administrative Aide, Katlyn Bettmann

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR- Dom M.

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2025 JUL 28 P 2:42
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

DECISION

APPROVED WITH A CONDITION.

TO: Rodrigo Neira
2 Hauser Terrace
Tappan, New York

HABR#25-03
July 8, 2025
Permit # BLDR-7090-25

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#25-03: Application of Rodrigo Neira, for a review of driveway pillars at an existing single-family residence located at 2 Hauser Terrace, Tappan, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4 (E), Historical Areas Board of Review.
Tax Map Designation: 77.11 / 1 / 8.2; R-15 zone

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, July 8, 2025 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Jose Neira, Homeowner, and Otto Aguilar, Contractor, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. A survey with the pillar locations marked, survey by Robert E. Surace, P.L.S., dated August 25, 2000.
2. A pool plan by Paul Gidanski, P.E., P.L.L.C, received May 27, 2025.
3. A narrative summary dated May 22, 2025.
4. Computer generated pictures of before and after, submitted with the HABR application, (2 pages).
5. A letter dated July 3, 2025, from John Morton and Jacqueline Shatz.

Chairman Wheatley stated that these pillars are existing, and that the location of the pillars seems controversial, and that they do not look like they are on their own property; that to him it seems as though they are built in the Town of Orangetown right of way(R.O.W.). He also asked if there would be lighting involved?

Stefanie Schera, Deputy Town Attorney, stated that anything in regards to distances would be the purview of another department; that the Applicant can speak with the Building Department, or other Agencies.

Otto Aguilar stated that there was a misunderstanding, and their Engineer was told to put these pillars in their original plans; that they were left out by mistake; that the pillars were then built, as well as the Belgian block driveway; that there will also be lighting installed on top of these pillars; that they have the piping there currently for the lights but have not yet run the wires;

Marjorie Galen asked if the Applicants would then have to show the Board what that lighting would look like?

Thano Schoppel asked if it would be possible to use a lower watt bulb, in consideration of the neighbors? He also agreed with Marjorie Galen, that the Board should see a sample of what the lighting lamps themselves would look like.

Stefanie Schera stated that if there are any issues with the neighbor having complaints of the lights being too bright, they should be referred to the Building Department as this would be beyond the scope of the Historic Board.

Otto Aguilar stated that they would be willing to install a softer light, or a solar light; that it would not be an issue; that they have a picture of the lights on his phone, but they did not bring a picture of the lights.

Thano Schoppel asked if it would be possible to view the picture with a make and model?

Chairman Wheatly stated that they could show the Board the picture, however there would need to be a physical copy submitted for the file, to the Clerk.

Loren Plotkin stated that this does not seem to be complete, and that he does not feel as though he can act on this application.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

2025 JUL 28 2:42

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Stefanie Schera stated that the application submitted for tonight's purposes in full and the Board is able to vote on what has been presented; that if the Board decides they are not in favor of the proposal the Applicant may seek to make a new application to the Board, or ask for continuance to submit additional documents.

William Walther stated that the Applicants did work that they should not have; that they want to have lights on their pillars, but have not supplied the Board with that information; that the Board will know the scale of what is being presented; and that it would not be something we can make a decision on.

Thano Schoppel stated that he feels this application should be continued at this time.

Loren Plotkin recommended that perhaps the Board may approve the pillars as presented and if the Applicant decides to add lighting they will have to come back and seek this approval with Board.

Otto Aguilar stated that these are not large in scale; that they can be sixteen (16") inch tall solar lights as discussed; that he has been waiting a year for this and he would like to finish the process;

Jose Neira stated that they had an existing light that fell down; that they then put up the pillar in the same location.

William Walther stated that they one light came down, the Applicant then added two pillars; that previously there was one light fixture, and now there exists two stone pillars four (4') feet high; that the applicant is also seeking to add lighting to these pillars.

Stefanie Schera stated that, in her opinion, this would be perhaps above the Boards purview as there is no mention of any lighting in this application; that the Board should directly address the pillars unless they would like to accept the lighting as a condition.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented with a condition, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed pillars:

1. The pillars are existing grey stone without lights.
2. The Applicant will need to return to seek approval if they wish to add any type of lighting to the existing pillars.

THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.

**** PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.**

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2025 Jul 28 2:42 PM
OWN CLERK S. ORFIERO

PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT , CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), a pool plan by Paul Gidanski, P.E., P.L.L.C, received May 27, 2025, a narrative summary dated May 22, 2025, computer generated pictures of before and after, submitted with the HABR application, (2 pages); is APPROVED WITH A CONDITION.

The foregoing resolution to approve the Plans labeled “a pool plan by Paul Gidanski, P.E., P.L.L.C, received May 27, 2025, a narrative summary dated May 22, 2025, computer generated pictures of before and after, submitted with the HABR application, (2 pages); WITH A SPECIFIC CONDITION: (1) if the Applicant wishes to add lighting to their pillars, they will need to appear in front of the Historic Board and present the appropriate documents for a decision to be rendered; prior approval of the Historical Area Board of Review is required prior to any change or modification or the requirements and/or conditions set forth in this Decision; was presented and moved by William Walter, seconded by Thano Schoppel and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Marjorie Galen, aye; Loren Plotkin, aye; William Walter, aye; and Chairman Wheatley, aye.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: July 8, 2025

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY:  _____
Administrative Aide, Katlyn Bettmann

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR- Dom M.

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2025 JUL 28 P 2:43
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

DECISION

APPROVED AS PRESENTED

TO: Michael Esmay(Palisades Free Library)
19 Closter Road
Palisades, New York

HABR#25-04
July 8, 2025
Permit # BLDC-4891-24

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#25-04: Application of Palisades Free Library, for a review of additions and alterations at an existing public library located at 19 Closter, Palisades, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4 (E), Historical Areas Board of Review.

Tax Map Designation: 78.17 / 2 / 22; R-40 zone

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, July 8, 2025 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Michael Esmay, Architect, and Maria Gagliardim., Library Director, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. Architectural Plans labelled “ Addition & Alteration to the Palisades Free Library”, with the most recent revision date of May 19, 2025, signed and sealed by Robert Michael Esmay, R.A., (3 pages).
2. A narrative summary received May 28, 2025, (3 pages).
3. A letter giving Michael Esmay, Architect, authorization to represent Palisades Free Library as their Agent for this project, dated May 23, 2025.
4. Computer generated picture of the Palisades Free Library, submitted with the HABR application, (1 page).
5. Computer generated pictures submitted at the HABR meeting, July 8, 2025, (2 pages).

Michael Esmay, Architect, stated that the library has been in existence for over 70 years; that in that time they have had a few additions; that he works with the library on their projects, and has had part in several of these projects; that they have previously made the meeting room bigger and at a higher level; that they also did an addition on the Closter Road side of the building; that it was eventually decided by the Board to provide an addition to the Children’s room side as well; that this room needs additional open space for play, for their story time, for the gatherings; that this project received preliminary approval from the Planning Board as well as the Zoning Board approval for several variances; that the goal of the Historic District is to preserve the Historic look of the character of the neighbor, which he believes he has done with this addition; that this is a small, under two hundred(200S.F.) square foot addition; that they are using Marvin windows to match the existing; that they are proposing a standing seem roof instead of the brown shingle roof; that there are sills to the windows which are bluestone to match; that the library is going to be repainted; that as it exists, the library is white, and will now be painted China white by Benjamin Moore; that this color has a very nice look to it and works well with the brown roof; that this will be bright and sunny;

Maria Gagliardi, Library Director, stated that the library is currently classic grey; that the new color will be China white and that the trim will be the same color; that this addition will allow for space in the children’s room for story time, room to play, space to dances, sing, etc.; that during the heavy storms the water collects and they have had leaks to that area; that they would like to stop that from happening; that they had a library referendum

William Walther stated that the improvements look very nice; he also asked how does the library handle the snow that piles up in that area?

Michael Esmay responded that when the snow piles they shovel it.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2025 JUL 28 P 2:43
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed addition:

1. The Roof shall be standing seal aluminum Color Tundra.
2. The House shall be sided in Wood Clapboard Siding painted China White.
3. The Soffits and Fascia shall be Azek composite white PVC.
4. The gutters and Leaders shall be 5" half round in Copper.
5. The Windows shall be Marvin wood casement in white.
6. The Trim shall be shall be Azek composite white PVC.
7. The Sills shall be Bluestone color blue/grey.

THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.

***** PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT , CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), Plans labeled "Architectural Plans labelled " Addition & Alteration to the Palisades Free Library", with the most recent revision date of May 19, 2025, signed and sealed by Robert Michael Esmay, R.A., (3 pages), narrative summary received May 28, 2025, (3 pages), computer generated picture of the Palisades Free Library, submitted with the HABR application, (1 page), computer generated pictures submitted at the HABR meeting, July 8, 2025, (2 pages)"; is APPROVED AS SUBMITTED.

JOHN CLERK'S OFFICE
2025 JUL 28 P 2:43
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

The foregoing resolution to approve the Plans labeled “Architectural Plans labelled “ Addition & Alteration to the Palisades Free Library”, with the most recent revision date of May 19, 2025, signed and sealed by Robert Michael Esmay, R.A., (3 pages), narrative summary received May 28, 2025, (3 pages), computer generated picture of the Palisades Free Library, submitted with the HABR application, (1 page), computer generated pictures submitted at the HABR meeting, July 8, 2025, (2 pages)”; as submitted, with the following condition: prior approval of the Historical Area Board of Review is required prior to any change or modification or the requirements and/or conditions set forth in this Decision; was presented and moved by Loren Plotkin, seconded by William Walther and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Scott Wheatley, aye; Loren Plotkin, aye; William Walter, aye. Marjorie Galen was recused.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: July 8, 2025

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY: -  _____
Administrative Aide, Katlyn Bettmann

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR- Glenn M

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2025 JUL 28 P 2:43
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE