

**MINUTES
HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
January 12, 2021**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Margaret Raso, Chair
Loren Plotkin
William Walther
Scott Wheatley
Larry Bucciarelli
Carol Schelin
Thano Schoppel

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide
Brittany Cordero, Deputy Town Attorney

Margaret Raso, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. Hearings on this meeting's agenda, which are made a part of this meeting, were held as noted below:

| <u>APPLICANTS</u> | <u>DECISION</u> | <u>HABR#</u> |
|---|---|--------------|
| COSBY 23 Closter Road Palisades, New York 78.17 / 2 / 24; R-40 zone | DIVIDED APPLICATION ROOF, GUTTERS AND LEADERS APPROVED: APPLICANT WILL RETURN FOR SIDING | HABR#21-01 |
| BECKERMAN 1 Kopac Lane Palisades, New York 78.13 / 1 / 3.16; R-40 zone | APPROVED AS SUBMITTED | HABR#21-02 |

THE DECISIONS RELATED TO THE ABOVE HEARINGS are inserted herein and made part of these minutes.

There being no further business to come before the Board, on motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 7:45 P.M.

DATED: January 12, 2021

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW

BY: 
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2021 JAN 25 P 1:21
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

DECISION
ROOF, GUTTERS AND LEADERS APPROVED AS PRESENTED

TO: Jennifer Crosby
23 Closter Road
Palisades, New York 10964

HABR #21-01
January 12, 2021
Permit #50910

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#21-01: Application of Jennifer Crosby for review of a new roof, siding and gutters at an existing single-family residence. The premises are located at 23 Closter Road, Palisades, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4 (A), Historical Areas Board of Review.

Tax Map Designation: 78.17 / 2 / 24; R-40 zoning district.

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, January 12, 2021 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Noel Naughton, contractor and Jennifer Crosby appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. A list of items to be installed: GAF Asphalt roof shingles in Charcoal; CertainTeed Vinyl Siding in in Castle Stone; White Vinyl CertainTeed soffits and fascia; White Aluminum Alcoa Mid America gutters and leaders; and white aluminum Alco Mid-America Trim.

Noel stated that they are proposing to install a new GAF roof in a similar color as what exists Charcoal; that the roof is damaged and has been patched but may not hold up through another storm; that the new siding will have the same color as the existing asbestos shingles that are on the house; that they will be covered with insulation and the CertainTeed vinyl siding will go over the insulation; that the job will be done in a tasteful professional manner; that he submitted detailed information to the Board regarding the proposed work; that they have been working on this for over 60 days; that there are no structural changes to the house; that this is not a cheap job; that this is a custom job that will modernize the house for energy efficiency without changing the look of the house; and that hardi plank is more than double the cost.

Jennifer Crosby stated that the exact age of the house is not known but she believes the house was built in 1880; that all of the original character of the house has been removed; that the current siding is not wood or original; that it is currently sided with asbestos shingles; that she has no intention of replacing or re-using asbestos singles; that her neighbor has a house that was built in 1902 and it presently has vinyl siding; that the look of what she is proposing would be similar to wood and have cleaner look and insulate the house and it would blend into the surrounding area; that she has not heard great things about hardi plank siding; that if she must, she will separate the application and get the roof and siding approved tonight and make a separate building permit application for the siding; and will do more research to see if she can find out what the original siding was on the house and in the surrounding area.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2021 JAN 25 P 1:21
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

Larry Bucciarelli stated that he had a problem with vinyl siding because of the age of the house; that he does believe any of the neighbors have used Vinyl as was indicated, that it is not permitted because the house was built prior to 1918 and does not conform to the original or existing siding; that hardi plank siding would be more of a replication to the original wood than vinyl siding.

Brittany Cordero, Attorney to the Board, read a portion of Chapter 12 to the Board and applicant and stated that houses built before 1918 have more extensive restrictions than houses built after that; that the law requires alterations must be consistent with the exterior materials, scale fenestration, colors, design and appearance of the existing original structure and told the Board that, if the Board wanted to vote on the other items in the application the roof, gutters and leaders, besides the siding, then the applicant would have the option to withdraw the siding proposal from the application and make a separate application and that she would send everyone Section 12 of the Code so they are familiar with the compliance requirements.

William Walther asked the applicant if she had any old photos of the house and surrounding houses because it would help them in their decision making; that they do not really know what is under the asbestos shingles.

Scott Wheatley stated that he was not opposed to the vinyl siding.

Thano Schoppell stated that houses built prior to 1918 are held to higher standards and the Board cannot exempt this house.

Loren Plotkin asked what the applicant's options were if they deny the application and was told that the applicant could appeal to the Zoning Board.

Margaret Raso asked about separating the applications into two parts so that the applicant could safely and quickly repair the roof.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented, and after applicant having withdrawn the portion containing the siding proposal, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed roof shingles, gutters and leaders were reviewed and the applicant will return with a separate application for the house siding:

1. The application for the above roof shingles, gutters and leaders are approved.
2. Applicant will return with a separate application for the siding.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2021 JAN 25 P 1:21
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

Crosby

HABR# 21-01

Permit #50910

Page 3 of 4

THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR

MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.

***** PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS

- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT DEBBIE ARBOLINO, CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2021 JAN 25 P 1:21
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), the application for roof shingles, gutters and leaders is APPROVED AS SUBMITTED having acknowledged that the Applicant removed the portion of the application containing a proposal for siding: APPLICANT WILL RETURN FOR SIDING APPROVAL ON A SEPARATE APPLICATION.


The foregoing resolution to approve the roof shingles, gutters and leaders for Jennifer Crosby for property located at 23 Closter Road, Palisades, HABR#21-01, as submitted; was presented and moved by Margaret Raso, seconded by Loren Plotkin; and carried as follows: William Walther, aye; Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; Scott Wheatley, aye; Carol Schelin, aye; Loren Plotkin, aye; and Larry Bucciarelli, aye.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: January 12, 2021

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY: -



Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR- M.M.

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE
2021 JAN 25 P 1:21
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

DECISION

APPROVED AS PRESENTED

TO: Jason Beckerman
1 Kopac Lane
Palisades, New York 10964

HABR #20-02
January 12, 2021
Permit #50519

FROM: HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR#21-02: Application of Jason Beckerman for review of a new Pavilion in the rear of an existing single-family residence. The premises are located at 1 Kopac Lane, Palisades, New York. Chapter 12 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown, Section 12-4 (A), Historical Areas Board of Review.

Tax Map Designation: 78.13 / 1 / 3.16; R-40 zoning district.

Heard by the HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, January 12, 2021 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Jason and Susan Beckerman and Kier Leveque, Architect, appeared.

The following documents were presented:

1. Architectural plans labeled "Beckerman Pavilion" dated June 24, 2020 signed and sealed by Kier B. Levesque, Architect.
2. A narrative dated September 22, 2020 from Kier B. Levesque, Architect.

Jason Beckerman stated that their house is the first house on the left as you enter the development off of Route 9W; that they are proposing to build a 20' x 20' pavilion in the back yard; that since the pandemic hit, they have a greater appreciation for the outdoor; that it would be a simple 20' x 20' roof on columns with a stone fireplace, bead board ceiling with recessed lighting facing downward; that they are not proposing any lights on the exterior of the structure; that all materials would match the house; that it would be a private part of the back yard and not visible from the street.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

Larry Bucciarelli stated that it is a nice addition to the house.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2021 JAN 25 P 1:21
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), found as fact, that: The application as presented, would not adversely affect the Historical Areas and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed Pavilion:

1. The roof shall be GAF Pewter gray to match the house.
2. The siding shall be light mist hardi plank to match the house.
3. The soffits and fascia shall be white Azek Nbeg Columns.
4. The lighting shall be recessed downward facing hi-hats.
5. The stone shall be Chardenay cultured stone 75% Southern Ledge and 25% Dressed Field.

THIS APPROVAL/DECISION, INCLUDING THE BOARD'S REQUIRED MODIFICATIONS TO THE APPLICANT'S DRAWINGS AND /OR PLANS, OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH HEREIN, IF ANY, IS GRANTED BY THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW SUBJECT TO ANY SUCH CONDITIONS AND/OR MODIFICATIONS, AND IS LIMITED TO THE SPECIFIC RELIEF REQUESTED HEREIN.

***** PRE-1918 CONSTRUCTION: PLEASE BE ADVISED: IN THE HISTORIC AREA, ALL CONSTRUCTION REQUIRING A BUILDING PERMIT OR ANY EXTERIOR CHANGES (INCLUDING PAINT COLOR) TO BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1918, REQUIRES APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW.***

PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE HISTORICAL AREA BOARD OF REVIEW IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO ANY CHANGE OR MODIFICATION OF THE REQUIREMENTS AND/OR CONDITIONS SET FORTH IN THIS DECISION, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO:

- ROOFING SHINGLES (IF CHANGING COLOR)
- SIDING
- DECORATIVE SIDING
- SOFFITS & FASCIA
- GUTTERS AND LEADERS
- WINDOWS
- TRIM
- SHUTTERS
- DOORS
- LIGHTING
- LOCATION OF AIR CONDITIONING UNITS
- WALKWAYS, PATIOS
- POOLS, SPAS AND FENCES
- SIGNS
- ANY CHANGE IN THE ABOVE LIST INCLUDING COLOR, MATERIAL AND/OR MANUFACTURER

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT DEBBIE ARBOLINO, CLERK TO THE HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW AT (845) 359-8410.

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2021 JAN 25 P 1:21
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE

BECKERMAN

HABR# 21-02

Permit #50519

Page 3 of 3

DECISION: In view of the foregoing, and after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony before the Board, and reviewing all drawings and plans, and other submissions, correspondence and reports (if any), the application for Pavilion is APPROVED AS SUBMITTED.

The foregoing resolution to approve the Pavilion for Jason and Susan Beckerman for property located at 1 Kopac Lane, Palisades, HABR#21-02, as submitted; was presented and moved by Thano Schoppel, seconded by Larry Bucciarelli; and carried as follows: William Walther, aye; Scott Wheatley, aye; Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; Carol Schelin, aye; Loren Plotkin, aye; and Larry Bucciarelli, aye.

The Administrative Aide to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: January 12, 2021

HISTORICAL AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

BY: Deborah Arbolino
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR- D.M.

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
2021 JAN 25 P 1:21
TOWN CLERK'S OFFICE