

**TOWN OF ORANGETOWN ARCHITECTURE AND COMMUNITY APPEARANCE  
BOARD OF REVIEW - MEETING OF NOVEMBER 3, 2011**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Jack Messina, Chairperson; James Dodge, Vice Chairperson; Jill Fieldstein; Michael Bosco; Larry Vail; Paul Papay and Dan Sherman

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** None

**ALSO PRESENT:** Barbara Gionta, Deputy Town Attorney; Ann Marie Ambrose, Stenographer and Cheryl Coopersmith, Chief Clerk

Jack Messina, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.  
Mr. Messina read the agenda. Hearings as listed on this meeting’s agenda which are made a part of these minutes were held as noted below.

<b>Saint Thomas Aquinas College</b>	<b>Approved</b>	<b>ACABOR #11-45</b>
Review of Amendment to	<b>Subject to</b>	
ACABOR #11-05, Athletic Field	<b>Conditions</b>	
Landscaping Plan		
74.19/1/1; LI zoning district		

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting by Jack Messina and seconded by Larry Vail and agreed by all in attendance. The Decisions on the above hearings, which Decisions are made by the Board before the conclusion of the meeting and are mailed to the applicant. The verbatim minutes are not transcribed, but are available. As there was no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 8: 10 p.m. The next ACABOR Meeting is scheduled for November 17, 2011.

**Dated: November 3, 2011**

**ACABOR #11-45: Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision**

**Amendment to ACABOR #11-05, Saint Thomas Aquinas College Athletic Field Landscaping Plan, Approved Subject to Conditions with Conditions**

**November 3, 2011**

**Page 1 of 3**

TO: John Atzl, Atzl, Scattassa, & Zigler, 234 North Main Street,  
New City, New York, 10956

FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: Saint Thomas Aquinas College Athletic Field Site Plan: The application of Saint Thomas Aquinas College, owner, for review of an Amendment to ACABOR #11-05, dated March 3, 2011, Landscaping Plan at a site known as “Saint Thomas Aquinas College Athletic Field Site Plan”, in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 280 Route 340, on the south side of Route 340, 850 feet west of the intersection of Kings Highway, Sparkill, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 74.20, Block 1, Lot 2, in the R-40 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, November 3, 2011**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

John Atzl appeared and testified for the applicant. The Board received the following items:

1. Athletic Field Plans prepared by Atzl, Scatassa & Sigler, P.C., dated June 30, 2010, last revised October 7, 2010:
  - a. Drawing No. 3: Grading Plan
  - b. Athletic Field /NYSDOT Plan and Access Profiles and Details
2. Athletic Field Planting Plan prepared by Robert Torgersen, ASLA, dated January 4, 2011, revised October 19, 2011.
3. A letter from Atzl, Scattassa, & Zigler, signed by John R. Atzl, PLS, dated October 17, 2011.
4. A copy of ACABOR #11-05, Approved with Conditions, dated March 3, 2011.
5. Submitted at the meeting, a letter from Martyn Ryan, Chairman, Orangetown Environmental Committee, dated November 3, 2011.

**FINDINGS OF FACT:**

1. The Board found that due to New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) requirements, the applicant needed to regrade the area between the fence and State Route 340. The State’s original request involved the removal of 40 trees; however, after the applicant reviewed the site plan with NYSDOT, the applicant saved 28 trees and proposed to replant 14 new trees.

**ACABOR #11-45: Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision**

**Amendment to ACABOR #11-05, Saint Thomas Aquinas College Athletic Field Landscaping Plan, Approved Subject to Conditions with Conditions**

**November 3, 2011**

**Page 2 of 3**

2. The Board found that the new trees to be planted are in conformance with NYSDOT requirements and include Snowdrift Crabapple, Shadblow Serviceberry, and Swanzan Cherry, all flowering fruit trees.
3. The Board found that a 20 foot wide gate would be placed in a location that currently exists as a natural gap in the vegetation.
4. The Board found that there was a drafting error on the Planting Plan prepared by Robert Torgersen, ASLA. A plan note refers to a Drainage Ditch as a Proposed Retaining Wall.

**Public Comments:**

Rebecca Gmucs, 4 Kingswood Drive, Orangeburg; requested information regarding the location of the wetlands in relation to the proposed field. Ms Gmucs wanted the Board to try and save as many trees as possible.

Martyn Ryan, Chairman, Orangetown Environmental Committee, 153 Hudson Terrace, Piermont; raised issue regarding the removal of native trees.

June Starke, 156 Kings Highway, Orangeburg; wanted to know the types of trees to be planted and those to be removed.

Laurie Beek, 262 Washington Street, Tappan; expressed concerns regarding the loss of trees from the site.

Dave Robinson, 380 Kings Highway, Orangeburg; noted that mature trees are an important feature to Orangetown.

Fran Oldenburger, 314 Greenbush Road, Blauvelt; a member of the Orangetown Environmental Committee, however, representing herself at the meeting, expressed concerns regarding the loss of trees to the community. She referenced studies that noted that trees help people with asthma and keeps the environment cooler. Ms Oldenburger also held that trees make a community more upscale and increase the property values.

The Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

**DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the Amendment to ACABOR #11-05, dated March 3, 2011, Saint Thomas Aquinas College Athletic Field Landscaping Plan is Approved Subject to Conditions:**

1. The applicant shall save 28 trees and replant 14 new trees, as noted on the submitted plan. The new trees to be planted are in conformance with NYSDOT requirements and include Snowdrift Crabapple, Shadblow Serviceberry, and Swanzan Cherry, all flowering fruit trees.

**ACABOR #11-45: Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision**

**Amendment to ACABOR #11-05, Saint Thomas Aquinas College Athletic Field Landscaping Plan, Approved Subject to Conditions with Conditions**

**November 3, 2011**

**Page 3 of 3**

2. A 20 foot wide gate would be placed in a location that currently exists as a natural gap in the vegetation.
3. The plan shall be revise to correct the drafting error on the Planting Plan prepared by Robert Torgersen, ASLA. A plan note refers to a Drainage Ditch as a Proposed Retaining Wall. The plan shall correctly identify the feature as a Drainage Ditch.
4. All previous and applicable conditions of ACABOR #11-05, dated March 3, 2011, remain in effect.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Jack Messina and seconded by Michael Bosco carried as follows: James Dodge, aye; Dan Sherman, aye; Jack Messina, aye; Michael Bosco, aye; Larry Vail, aye; Paul Papay, aye and Jill Fieldstein, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed, and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

**Dated: November 3, 2011**

**Town of Orangetown**

**Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review**