

TOWN OF ORANGETOWN ARCHITECTURE AND COMMUNITY APPEARANCE BOARD OF REVIEW - MEETING OF JULY 12, 2012

MEMBERS PRESENT: Paul Papay, Chairman; Jill Fieldstein, Blythe Yost, Thomas Warren and Alex DiMenna

MEMBERS ABSENT: Jack Messina, Vice Chairman, and James Dodge

ALSO PRESENT: Rick Pakola, Deputy Town Attorney; Ann Marie Ambrose, Stenographer and Cheryl Coopersmith, Chief Clerk

Paul Papay, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. Mr. Papay read the agenda. Hearings as listed on this meeting's agenda which are made a part of these minutes were held as noted below.

Continued Item from the June 21, 2012 Meeting:

Helmke & Alatsas Plans **Approved Subject** **ACABOR #12-33**
Review of House/Site Plans **to Conditions**
Blickman Subdivision
69.19/1/25.3; R-40 zoning district

Blue Hill Plaza – Mack Cali Façade Plan **ACABOR #12-34**
Review of Façade Plans **Approved Subject**
73.05/1/54; OP zoning district **to Conditions**

Retro Fitness Sign Plan **ACABOR #12-35**
Review of Sign Plan **Approved**
77.15/1/41; CS zoning district **as Presented**

Neighbor RX Pharmacy Sign Plan **ACABOR #12-36**
Review of Sign Plan **Approved**
69.13/1/1.2; CC zoning district **as Presented**

Orangeburg Shopping Center Façade Plan **ACABOR #12-37**
Review of Façade Plans **Approved Subject**
74.10/1/67; CS zoning district **to Conditions**

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting by Jill Fieldstein and seconded by Thomas Warren and agreed by all in attendance. The Decisions on the above hearings, which Decisions are made by the Board before the conclusion of the meeting and mailed to the applicant. The verbatim minutes are not transcribed, but are available. As there was no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 8:50 p.m. The next ACABOR Meeting is scheduled for July 26, 2012.

Dated: July 12, 2012
Town of Orangetown
Architecture and Community
Appearance Board of Review

ACABOR #12-33 - Helmke & Alatsas Plans: Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 12, 2012

Page 1 of 3

TO: George Alatsas, 17 Bluefields Lane, Blauvelt, New York 10913
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: Helmke & Alatsas Plans: The application of William Helmke and George Alatsas, Bluefields Contracting Corporation, owner, for the review of House/Site Plans, at a site known as "**Helmke & Alatsas Plans**", in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 652 Gilbert Avenue, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 69.19, Block 1, Lot 25.3 in the R-40 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at meetings held **Thursday, June 21 and July 12, 2012**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

June 21, 2012

William Helmke, George Alatsas and Donald Brenner appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

- A. Architectural Plans prepared by Robert Hoene, RA, dated April 17, 2012, last revised on May 17, 2012:
 - 1 of 4: Elevations
 - 2 of 4: Foundation/Basement Floor Plan with Wall Section
 - 3 of 4: First Floor Plan & Deck Section
 - 4 of 4: General Notes, Second Floor Plan & Portico Detail
- B. Site Plan prepared by Robert Sorace, PLS, dated May 16, 2012
- C. Photograph of the proposed house with landscaping.
- D. Presented at the meeting, a drawing of the proposed landscaping.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the proposed house would have four sides of white siding, either in vinyl or hardiboard siding with decorative stonework on the front facade. The Board gave the applicant the option of either type of siding. The stonework would be real stone in grey tones. The trim and soffits would be white and the roof shingles would be grey and manufactured by Timberline. The shutters would be black. There would be a bluestone entryway and paver walkway. The front entrance and garage area would have downward pointing lantern style lighting.

ACABOR #12-33 - Helmke & Alatsas Plans: Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 12, 2012

Page 2 of 3

2. The Board found that the air conditioning unit would be located at the right corner of the house, to the rear of the site.
3. The Board found that the landscaping plan included deer resistant type of plantings, junipers, boxwood or ilex in the front yard.
4. The Board found that the site plan did not note the extent of site disturbance for the construction of the house. Trees over 8 inches in diameter that needed to be removed were not noted on the plan with an "X".
5. The Board found that the applicant was indecisive regarding the proposed location of the utilities and presented different scenarios that involved removal of trees on the site.

Public Comment: Jean Bleich, 642 Gilbert Avenue, Pearl River: requested information regarding the height, width and length of the new house. She questioned the Board regarding the amount of disturbance of the site, the number of trees to be removed and where the house would be located.

The applicant requested a **CONTINUATION** of the application.

July 12, 2012

William Helmke, George Alatsas and Donald Brenner appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

- A. A letter from Steve R. Griggs, President, Land Design Studio, Inc., dated June 30, 2012, concerning trees scheduled for removal upon approval of ACABOR.
- B. Revised Architectural Plans, same date.
- C. Revised Site Plan, same date.
- D. Tree Replenishment Plan, prepared by Robert Sorace, PLS, no date.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the revised Site Plan and Tree Replenishment Plan were acceptable. The Board noted that the site is attractive and that the plantings created a nice buffer for abutting property owners.
2. The Board found the revised Architectural plans were acceptable, noting the Zero Clearance Chimney on the side of the house and the plumbing vent line on the garage/rear side of the house was acceptable.

ACABOR #12-33 - Helmke & Alatsas Plans: Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 12, 2012

Page 3 of 3

The hearing was then opened to the Public. There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was APPROVED SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. The proposed house will have four sides of white siding, either in vinyl or hardiboard siding with decorative stonework on the front facade. The applicant has the option of either type of siding. The stonework will be real stone in grey tones. The trim and soffits will be white and the roof shingles will be grey and manufactured by Timberline. The shutters will be black. There will be a bluestone entryway and paver walkway. The front entrance and garage area will have downward pointing lantern style lighting. There will be a Zero Clearance Chimney on the side of the house and there is a plumbing vent line on the garage/rear side of the house.
2. The air conditioning unit will be located at the right corner of the house to the rear of the site.
3. The landscaping plan includes deer resistant type of plantings, junipers, boxwood or ilex in the front yard.
4. Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.
5. No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.
6. If applicable, the applicant shall comply with the Energy Star requirements, per the Town of Orangetown Building Department.
7. If applicable, the applicant shall comply with the requirements of Section 21-25 of the Town of Orangetown Shade Tree Ordinance.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Alex DiMenna and seconded by Thomas Warren and carried as follows; Paul Papay, Chairman, aye; Jack Messina, Vice Chairman, absent; Jill Fieldstein, aye; James Dodge, absent; Thomas Warren, aye; Blythe Yost, aye; and Alex DiMenna, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed, and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: July 12, 2012

**Town of Orangetown
Architecture and Community
Appearance Board of Review**

**ACABOR #12-34: Blue Hill Plaza – Mack-Cali Façade Plan – Approved
Subject to Conditions**

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision**

July 12, 2012

Page 1 of 2

TO: Donald Brenner, 4 Independence Avenue, Tappan, New York
10983

FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: Blue Hill Plaza - Mack Cali Façade Plan: The application of Blue Hill Plaza – Mack Cali, applicant for Glorious Sun Robert Martin, LLC, owner, for the review of a Façade Plan, at a site known as “**Blue Hill Plaza – Mack Cali Façade Plan**”, in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 1 Blue Hill Plaza, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 73.05, Block 1, Lot 54 in the OP zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, July 12, 2012**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Donald Brenner and Robert Keefe appeared and testified. The Board received the following items:

- A. Site Plan of Blue Hill Plaza.
- B. Photographs of the current color and the proposed color of the building, Willow Grey – Analytical Gray (7051).
- C. Project – Sheer Wall Repair – Specification Sheets.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the applicant proposed to resurface Building #1 with Willow Grey – Analytical Grey color. Building #2 would eventually be resurfaced in the same material.
2. The Board found that due to the weathering of the concrete facades over the past 30 years, the original color of the Blue Hill Plaza buildings, have darkened. The applicant stated that a significant amount of discoloration have occurred at the corners of the structure, therefore, the project would begin by applying the material to the corners of the building and eventually to the entire building. When the budget allows, Building #2 would be treated with the same material.
3. The Board found that the wireless antennas on Building #1 would be painted to match the new masonry surface.
4. The Board found that the applicant would perform the work on Building #1 and Building #2 within a reasonable amount of time.
5. The Board found that there will be no site work to be done to the site.

The hearing was then opened to the Public. There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

**ACABOR #12-34: Blue Hill Plaza – Mack-Cali Façade Plan – Approved
Subject to Conditions**

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision**

**July 12, 2012
Page 2 of 2**

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **APPROVED WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:**

1. The Board approves the resurfacing of Building #1 with the Willow Grey – Analytical Grey color at the corners and eventually the entire building. At the time the budget allows for the resurfacing of Building #2, the applicant shall treat Building #2 with the same material. The work for both buildings would be performed within a reasonable amount of time.
2. The wireless antennas on Building #1 will be painted to match the masonry surface.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Thomas Warren and seconded by Alex DiMenna and carried as follows: Paul Papay, aye; James Dodge, absent; Blythe Yost, aye; Jack Messina, absent; Alex DiMenna, aye; Thomas Warren, aye; and Jill Fieldstein, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

**Dated: July 12, 2012
Town of Orangetown
Architecture and Community
Appearance Board of Review**

ACABOR #12-35: Retro Fitness Sign Plan - Approved as Presented

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

Dated: July 12, 2012

Page 1 of 2

TO: Brian O'Connor, Frohling Sign Company 419 Route 59, Nanuet, New York 10954
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: Retro Fitness Sign Plan: The application of Frohling Sign Company, applicant for Tappan Shopping Center, owner, for the review of a Sign Plan, at a site known as "**Retro Fitness Sign Plan**", in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 47 Route 303, Tappan, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 77.15, Block 1, Lot 41 in the CS zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, July 12, 2012**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Brian O'Connor appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

- A. Sign Plans, prepared by Effective Sign Works, dated April 25, 2012.
- B. Photograph of the Building.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found the proposed sign would read, "Retro Fitness", in yellow, red and black, L.E.D. internally illuminated channel letters. The sign area square foot assessment measures 2'-10" in height by 14' -1" equaling 39.9 square feet.
2. The Board found the sign was described as follows and on the submitted drawing:
 - Plex Color: white
 - Trim Cap Color: red.
 - Return Depth: 8"
 - Return Color: black
 - Lighting Color: white

The hearing was then opened to the Public. There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

ACABOR #12-35: Retro Fitness Sign Plan - Approved As Presented

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

July 12, 2012

Page 2 of 2

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **APPROVED AS PRESENTED.**

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Thomas Warren and seconded by Blythe Yost and carried as follows; Paul Papay, Chairman, aye; Jack Messina, Vice Chairman, absent; Jill Fieldstein, aye; James Dodge, absent; Thomas Warren, aye; Blythe Yost, aye; and Alex DiMenna, nay.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed, and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: July 12, 2012

Town of Orangetown

Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

ACABOR #12-36: Neighbor RX Pharmacy Sign Plan – Approved as Presented

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 12, 2012

Page 1 of 1

TO: Jonah Eisenberg, Mobile GraFX Sign Company, 2054 Route 9W, #300, New Windsor, New York 12553
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: Neighbor RX Pharmacy Sign Plan: The application of Mobile GraFX Sign Company, applicant for Genisa Realty Corporation, owner, for the review of a Sign Plan, at a site to be known as “**Neighbor RX Pharmacy Sign Plan**”, in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 139 North Middletown Road, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 69.13, Block 1, Lot 1.2 in the CC zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, July 12, 2012**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Jonah Eisenberg appeared and testified for the applicant.

The Board received the following items:

- A. Sign Plans prepared by Mobile GraFX Sign Company, dated April 17, 2012, with photographs of the building.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. Board found that the sign would measure 99.69 inches by 28.9 inches. The sign is described as follows and on the submitted drawing:

Split Pill Logo Aluminum Channel, 1 piece, with 5 inch black return “neighbor & pharmacy” Aluminum Channel letters with 5 inch black return, “RZ” Aluminum Channel (1 piece) with 5 inch black return 3/16 inch Plexi face, with applied translucent film to match corporate colors. Black trim cap. Led illuminated, single unit Raceway 20” x 98” x 5”, raceway to be painted to match the building. Raceway mounted to fascia with custom brackets.

The hearing was then opened to the Public. There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DESICION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by James Dodge and seconded by Jack Messina and carried as follows; Paul Papay, Chairman, aye; Jack Messina, Vice Chairman, aye; Jill Fieldstein, aye; James Dodge, aye; Thomas Warren, aye; Blythe Yost, aye; and Alex DiMenna, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: July 12, 2012

Town of Orangetown

Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

**ACABOR #12-37: Orangeburg Shopping Center Façade Plan – Approved
subject to Conditions**

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision**

July 27, 2012

Page 1 of 3

TO: Norman Dichiara, Norman Dichiara Architects, P.C., 102 Waller
Avenue, White Plains, New York 10605

FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: Orangeburg Shopping Center Façade Plan: The application of
John Cannon, Urstadt & Biddle Properties, Inc., owner, for the review of a
Facade Plan, at a site known as “**Orangeburg Shopping Center Façade Plan**”,
in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and
Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 1-45
Orangeburg Shopping Center, Orangeburg, Town of Orangetown, Rockland
County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 74.10,
Block 1, Lot 67 in the CS zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the
Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, July 12, 2012**, at which time
the Board made the following determinations:

Paul Tepfer and John Cannon appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

A. Architectural Plans prepared by Norman Dichiara Architects, last
revision date of June 28, 2012:

A001: Title Sheet and Notes

A002: General Notes

A003: Specifications

A004: Specifications

MP-1: Master Plan

MRP-1: Master Roof Plan

A101.1: Plans and Elevations Building 1

A101.2: Plans and Elevations Building 1

A101.3: Plans and Elevations Building 1

A101.4: Plans and Elevations Building 2

A101.5: Plans and Elevations Building 2

A101.6: Plans and Elevations Building 3

A201: Details

A202: Building Sections

Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 12, 2012

Page 2 of 3

A203: Building Sections
A301: Sections
A302: Sections
A801: Door Schedule/Door Details
S.200: General Notes
S.201: Plans & Elevations – Building One
S.202: Plans Building One
S.203: Plans Building Two
S.204: Plans Building Three
S.301: Structural Details
S.302: Structural Details
S.303: Structural Details
Building #1 Partial West Elevation
Building #1 Partial West Elevation and Building #2 North Elevation
Building #3 East Elevation

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the applicant proposed to place a new façade over the existing structure of dryvit in pearl ash #106 and buckskin #449, a new standing seam metal roof in bronze color, and stonework of Eldorado Manzanita cliffstone as noted on the submitted elevations.
2. The Board found that the windows would be replaced with bronze aluminum with glass storefronts with natural stone window sills in tan lime stone. The majority of the site lighting would be recessed in the soffits, with additional cutoff fixtures as shown on the submitted drawings.
3. The Board found that a main feature of the roof line would be the addition of a glass and metal tower to be located on top of the CVS store. The tower would be approximately 22 feet by 22 feet and decorated seasonally (i.e. holiday lighting). The Board determined that the tower lighting would be no brighter than that of a normal office building at that height or level.
4. The Board found that there would be a unified signage design standard for the shopping center. Each store sign would be raised up on the front face of the storefront on rail system. The individual store owner would need to apply to the Building Department for a separate Building Permit for their sign.

Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

July 12, 2012

Page 3 of 3

Public Comment:

Helen Ucker, 7 Oak Street, Orangeburg: raised concerns regarding the tower on top of the structure. Ms Ucker wanted to know the purpose of the tower and found the tower unsightly. She opposed the tower.

The Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **APPROVED SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:**

1. The new façade shall be dryvit in pearl ash #106 and buckskin #449. There shall be a new standing seam metal roof in bronze color, and stonework of Eldorado Manzanita cliffstone as noted on the submitted elevations.
2. The windows will be replaced with bronze aluminum with glass storefronts with natural stone window sills in tan lime stone. The majority of the site lighting will be recessed in the soffits, with additional cutoff fixtures as shown on the submitted drawings.
3. The lighting in the glass and metal tower located on top of the CVS store shall be no brighter than that of a normal office building at that height or level.
4. There will be a unified signage design standard for the shopping center.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Jill Fieldstein and seconded by Thomas Warren and carried as follows; Paul Papay, Chairman, aye; Jack Messina, Vice Chairman, absent; Jill Fieldstein, aye; James Dodge, absent; Thomas Warren, aye; Blythe Yost, aye; and Alex DiMenna, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: July 12, 2012

Town of Orangetown

**Architecture and Community
Appearance Board of Review**

**Amendment to ACABOR #12-37: Orangeburg Shopping Center Façade Plan
– Approved Subject to Conditions**

**Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of
Review Decision**

August 10, 2012

Page 1 of 1

TO: Norman Dichiara, Norman Dichiara Architects, P.C., 102 Waller
Avenue, White Plains, New York 10605
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: An Amendment to Orangeburg Shopping Center Façade Plan: The application of John Cannon, Urstadt & Biddle Properties, Inc., owner, for the review of a Facade Plan, at a site known as “**Orangeburg Shopping Center Façade Plan**”, in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 1-45 Orangeburg Shopping Center, Orangeburg, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York, and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 74.10, Block 1, Lot 67 in the CS zoning district.

Amendment to FINDINGS OF FACT #3, Add the BOLD information:

The Board found that a main feature of the roof line would be the addition of a glass and metal tower to be located on top of the CVS store. The tower would be approximately 22 feet by 22 feet and decorated seasonally (i.e. holiday lighting **or other types of decoration**), **as well as used as a display space for the shopping center**. The Board determined that the tower lighting would be no brighter than that of a normal office building at that height or level.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Amendment to the Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: August 10, 2012
Town of Orangetown
Architecture and Community
Appearance Board of Review