

**TOWN OF ORANGETOWN ARCHITECTURE AND COMMUNITY APPEARANCE
BOARD OF REVIEW - MEETING OF JANUARY 19, 2012**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Jack Messina, Chairperson; James Dodge, Vice Chairperson; Larry Vail; Paul Papay and Jill Fieldstein

MEMBERS ABSENT: Dan Sherman and Michael Bosco
ALSO PRESENT: Barbara Gionta, Deputy Town Attorney; Ann Marie Ambrose, Stenographer and Cheryl Coopersmith, Chief Clerk

Jack Messina, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. Mr. Messina read the agenda. Hearings as listed on this meeting's agenda which are made a part of these minutes were held as noted below.

Continued Item from January 5, 2012:

Ringner Plans Review of Site/Structure Plans 68.18/3/41; R-15 zoning district	Approved Subject to Conditions	ACABOR #12-01
--	---	----------------------

New Items:

2 Union Street Plans Amendment to ACABOR #10-31 Dated July 15, 2010 77.08/5/16; CS zoning district	Approved Subject to Conditions	ACABOR #12-03
--	---	----------------------

Chung Plans Review of Site/Structure Plans 78.17/1/44; R-15 zoning district	Approved Subject to Conditions	ACABOR #12-04
--	---	----------------------

Bachman Plans Review of Site/Structure Plans 68.15/3/42; RG zoning district	Approved Subject to Conditions	ACABOR #12-05
--	---	----------------------

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting by Jack Messina and seconded by Paul Papay and agreed by all in attendance. The Decisions on the above hearings, which Decisions are made by the Board before the conclusion of the meeting and are mailed to the applicant. The verbatim minutes are not transcribed, but are available. As there was no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 8:30 p.m. The next ACABOR Meeting is scheduled for February 2, 2012.

Dated: January 19, 2012

ACABOR #12-01: Ringner Plans - Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

January 19, 2012

Page 1 of 3

TO: Frank Ringner, 56 Nauraushaun Avenue, Pearl River, NY 10965
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: The application of Frank Ringner, owner, for the Review of Site and Structure Plans, at a site known as "Ringner Plans", in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 56 South Nauraushaun Avenue, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 69.18, Block 3, Lot 41 in the R-15 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at meetings held **Thursday, January 5 & 19, 2012**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

January 5, 2012

Frank Ringner and Robert Hoene appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

1. Architectural Plans prepared by Robert Hoene, RA, dated May 23, 2011, revised July 7, 2011:
 - A1-0: Elevations
 - A2.0: Foundation/ First Floor Plan & Site Plan
 - A3.0: General Notes & Second Floor Plan
2. Survey Plan noting location of trees to be removed and new trees to be planted.
3. ZBA #11-94, Floor Area Ratio Variance Approved, dated November 16, 2011.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the existing structure would be demolished and a new house would be constructed.
2. The Board found that the applicant requested a continuation of the application, since materials for the façade were not available for presentation at the meeting.
3. The Board found that there are existing pine trees on the site that will be removed due to storm related damages. In addition, an existing Sycamore tree may need to be removed due to the construction of the new house. The applicant proposed to add new flower beds and some new trees to the site.

ACABOR #12-01: Ringner Plans - Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

January 19, 2012

Page 2 of 3

4. The Board found that the applicant should address the west side of the house at the next meeting, this side of house had only one window.
5. The Board found that on page #2, a note regarding removal of the "Existing Metal Shed" should be deleted from the page.
6. The Board found that there shall be no additional exterior lighting with the exception of safety lighting at the site.

Public Comment:

Bernie Gallagher, 45 Naurausaun Avenue, raised concerns regarding the height of the existing pine trees on the property and the safety of the old trees.

The application was **CONTINUED**.

January 19, 2012

Frank Ringner and Robert Hoene appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

1. Submitted at the meeting, Architectural Plans prepared by Robert Hoene, RA, dated May 23, 2011, revised July 7, 2011(changes made, date not updated)

A1-0: Elevations

A2.0: Foundation/ First Floor Plan & Site Plan

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the requested revisions were addressed, by adding two windows on the west side of the house and removal of the note on page#2.
2. The Board found that the proposed house had four sides of hardipank with decorative cultured stone on the front façade. The hardipank would be Sherwood Beige, manufactured by Owens Corning. The stonework would be Chardonnay Crest Fieldstone, manufactured by Cultured Stone. All trim would be white. The garage door would have a sunburst and lighting would be carriage style, located between the garage doors.

ACABOR #12-01: Ringner Plans - Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

January 19, 2012

Page 3 of 3

The hearing was then opened to the Public. There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was APPROVED SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. The proposed house will have four sides of hardipank with decorative cultured stone on the front façade. The hardipank will be Sherwood Beige, manufactured by Owens Corning. The stonework will be Chardonnay Crest Fieldstone, manufactured by Cultured Stone. All trim will be white. The garage doors will have a sunburst and lighting will be carriage style, located between the garage doors.
2. Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.
3. No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.
4. If applicable, the applicant shall comply with the requirements of Section 21-25 of the Town of Orangetown Shade Tree Ordinance.
5. If applicable, the applicant shall to comply with the Energy Star requirements, per the Town of Orangetown Building Department.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Jill Fieldstein and seconded by Jack Messina and carried as follows: James Dodge, aye, Dan Sherman, absent; Jack Messina, aye; Michael Bosco, absent; Larry Vail, aye; Paul Papay, aye and Jill Fieldstein, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: January 19, 2012

Town of Orangetown

Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

ACABOR #12-03

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

**Amendment to ACABOR #10-31, #2 Union Street Building Elevations Plans
- Approved with Conditions**

January 19, 2012

Page 1 of 3

TO: Caitlin Burck, 20 Stevenson Street, Piermont, New York 10968
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: The application of Piermont Design Group, applicant, for Cliff Ledge Properties, LLC, owner, for the review of an Amendment to ACABOR #10-31, dated July 15, 2010, at a site known as “#2 Union Street”, in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 2 Union Street, Sparkill, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 77.08, Block 5, Lot 16 in the CS zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, January 19, 2012**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Caitlin Burck appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

1. Architectural Plans prepared by Dodaro Ross Architects, dated June 27, 2010:
Sheet A001: Cover Sheet; North Elevations
2. Sample Color Sheet.
3. Specifications for Outdoor Poster Swing Cases.
4. Landscape Plans prepared by Daniel Sherman, Landscape Architect, dated October 13, 2011.
5. A copy of a letter from Caitlin E. Burck, Piermont Design Group, to Burt Von Wurmb, Orangetown Building Department, dated January 2, 2012.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found the applicant requested modifications from the plans approved under ACABOR #10-31; those modifications were reviewed by the Board and included the following changes:
 - Stucco color: Farrow & Ball, Pavilion Gray
 - Trim color: Farrow & Ball Manor House Gray
 - Windows and doors: Black
 - Air Conditioning units: Moved to east side of care takers structure on back of building with screening
 - Modified Awning Design and Material: Vermont Black Slate

ACABOR #12-03

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

Amendment to ACABOR #10-31, #2 Union Street Building Elevations Plans - Approved with Conditions

January 19, 2012

Page 2 of 3

2. The Board found that the applicant requested the addition of the following details to the plans:

Lighted Outdoor Display case: Applicant presented plans, however requested that as alternative be granted: the ability to obtain and install a Vintage Display case.

Signage for the north elevation of Building, "Union Arts Center". Lettering would range from 12 inches to 18 inches in height, in metal or bronze.

The gate located in the ally would either be wood or Azak, painted black.

3. The Board found that the applicant requested a delay in the construction of the west facing second floor balcony. The applicant stated that construction may occur in Spring 2012. The plans and details would remain the same as previously submitted and approved.

The hearing was then opened to the Public. There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DESICION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **APPROVED SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:**

1. The following modifications to ACABOR #10-31 are approved:

Stucco color: Farrow & Ball, Pavilion Gray

Trim color: Farrow & Ball Manor House Gray

Windows and doors: Black

Air Conditioning units: Moved to east side of care takers structure on back of building with screening

Modified Awning Design and Material: Vermont Black Slate

2. The following additional details to the plans are approved:

Lighted Outdoor Display case: Alternative is approved to obtain and install a Vintage Display case.

Signage for the north elevation of Building, "Union Arts Center". Lettering may range from 12 inches to 18 inches in height, in metal or bronze.

The gate located in the ally would either be wood or Azak, painted black.

ACABOR #12-03

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

Amendment to ACABOR #10-31, #2 Union Street Building Elevations Plans - Approved with Conditions

January 19, 2012

Page 3 of 3

2. The Board approved the requested delay in the construction of the west facing, second floor balcony. The applicant stated that construction may occur in Spring 2012. The plans and details shall remain the same as previously submitted and approved.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Larry Vail and seconded by Jill Fieldstein and carried as follows; James Dodge, aye; Dan Sherman, absent; Michael Bosco, absent, Jack Messina, aye; Paul Papay, aye; Jill Fieldstein, aye and Larry Vail, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: January 19, 2012

Town of Orangetown

Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

ACABOR #12-04

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

Chung Plans- Approved Subject to Conditions

January 19, 2012

Page 1 of 2

TO: Jane Slavin, R.A., 25 Greenbush South Road, Orangeburg,
New York 10965

FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: The application of Paul Chung, owner, for the Review of Site and Structure Plans for the construction of a two car garage at a site known as “Chung Plans,” in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 4 Dakota Street, Palisades, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 78.18, Block 1, Lot 44 in the R-15 zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, January 19, 2012**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Jane Slavin and Paul Chung appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

1. Site Plan prepared by Jane Slavin, R.A., dated October 12, 2011, revised November 11, 2011.
2. Architectural Plan prepared by Jane Slavin, R.A., dated April 29, 2011.
3. Submitted at the meeting, photographs of the site, type of proposed garage door, and list of building materials and colors.
4. A Specification Sheet of Grasspave2, the proposed driveway material.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1. The Board found that the proposed two car garage façade would match in material to the existing house on the site. The existing garage would be converted to living space. The new garage would have four sides of vinyl siding, manufactured by Certainteed in Granite Grey. The trim, gutters, leaders and molding would be white and the decorative stonework would be Mountain Ledge - Asherville, manufactured by Eldorado Stone. The roof would be Charcoal, manufactured by Timberline.
2. The Board found that the proposed Garage Doors would be steel, manufactured by Overhead Door Company, in a grey color.
3. The Board found that if required, the air conditioning unit would be placed on the side yard by the structure.
4. The Board found that the applicant proposed to use Grasspave2 for the driveway to the garage. The driveway would have lighting built into the sides of the driveway system.

ACABOR #12-04

Town of Orangetown – Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review Decision

Chung Plans- Approved Subject to Conditions

January 19, 2012

Page 2 of 2

The hearing was then opened to the Public. There being no one to be heard from the public, the Public Hearing portion of the meeting was closed.

DESICION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **APPROVED SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:**

1. The proposed two car garage façade will match in material to the existing house on the site. The existing garage will be converted to living space. The new garage will have four sides of vinyl siding, manufactured by Certainteed in Granite Grey. The trim, gutters, leaders and molding will be white and the decorative stonework would be Mountain Ledge - Asherville, manufactured by Eldorado Stone. The roof will be Charcoal, manufactured by Timberline. The proposed Garage Doors would be steel, manufactured by Overhead Door Company, in a grey color.
2. If required, the air conditioning unit would be placed on the side yard by the structure.
3. Grasspave2 will be used for the surface of the driveway to the garage. The driveway will have lighting built into the sides of the driveway system.
4. No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Jack Messina and seconded by Jill Fieldstein and carried as follows; James Dodge, aye; Dan Sherman, absent; Michael Bosco, absent, Jack Messina, aye; Paul Papay, aye; Jill Fieldstein, aye and Larry Vail, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

Dated: January 19, 2012

**Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review
Town of Orangetown**

ACABOR #12- 05
Bachman Plans - Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision

January 19, 2012

Page 1 of 3

TO: Christopher & Elena Bachman, 64 Center Street
Pearl River, New York 10965
FROM: Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review

RE: The application of Tri Bee Ltd., Applicant, for Elena and Christopher Bachman, owners, for the Review of Site and Structure Plans for the construction of a new dwelling at a site known as "Bachman Plans", in accordance with Article 16 of the Town Law of the State of New York and Chapter 2 of the Code of the Town of Orangetown. The site is located at 96 Lincoln Avenue, Pearl River, Town of Orangetown, Rockland County, New York and as shown on the Orangetown Tax Map as Section 68.15, Block 3, Lot 42 in the RG zoning district.

Heard by the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review of the Town of Orangetown at a meeting held **Thursday, January 19, 2012**, at which time the Board made the following determinations:

Elena and Christopher Bachman and Thomas Bertussi appeared and testified.

The Board received the following items:

1. Plot Plan prepared by Jay Greenwell, PLS, dated November 1, 2011.
2. Site Planting Plan prepared by Robert Torgersen, dated December 26, 2011.
3. Architectural Plans prepared by Custom Building Systems, LLC, pages 1G through 25G, last revision date of November 2, 2011, attachment letter dated September 27, 2011 from the State of New York, signed by Ronald Piester, AIA, Director, Division of Code Enforcement and Administration.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

1. The Board found that the existing structure on the site would be demolished and a new dwelling would be built. The proposed dwelling would be located at a similar location on the lot, however, the structure footprint would be a little larger. Due to the larger house footprint, a couple of existing trees need to be removed, a maple on the left side of the lot and 4 pine trees on the right side of the lot. In addition, the Board gave the applicant the option of removing some existing shrubbery on the southwest part of the lot.

ACABOR #12- 05
Bachman Plans - Approved Subject to Conditions

Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision

January 19, 2012
Page 2 of 3

2. The Board found that façade would have four sides of vinyl siding in Certainteed Main Street in Autumn Yellow with White trim. The roof would have shingles of Tamko Heritage Series in Rustic Cedar. The trim, garage doors and Scallop siding on the house would be white. The front entryway door would be white or stained a natural wood. The lighting on the site would be safety lighting in a Coach style and located at the front porch, garage and back porch. The front stairway would be cement block and bluestone material.
3. The Board found that the air conditioning unit will be located on the left side of the house, towards the rear.

Public Comments:

Tim Norum, 95 Lincoln Avenue, raised concerns regarding the removal of Pine trees on the project site. He noted that the trees would cause damage if they came down during a storm.

Walter O'Conner, 110 Lincoln Avenue, held that he did not object to the placement of the air conditioner unit, however, requested that landscaping be placed around the perimeter of the unit.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application was **APPROVED SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:**

1. The applicant shall have the option of removing some existing shrubbery on the southwest part of the lot.
2. The proposed house shall have four sides of vinyl siding in Certainteed Main Street in Autumn Yellow with White trim. The roof will have shingles of Tamko Heritage Series in Rustic Cedar. The trim, garage doors and Scallop siding on the house will be white. The front entryway door will be white or stained a natural wood. The lighting on the site will be safety lighting in a Coach style and located at the front porch, garage and back porch. The front stairway will be cement block and bluestone material.
3. The applicant has the option of placing scallop siding on both corners on the second level of the house or not placing scallop trim on the house.
4. The air conditioning unit will be located on the left side of the house, towards the rear. A dense evergreen screening shall be planted around both sides of the air conditioner unit.

**ACABOR #12- 05
Bachman Plans - Approved Subject to Conditions**

**Town of Orangetown Architecture and Community Appearance
Board of Review Decision**

January 19, 2012

Page 3 of 3

5. Trees to be saved shall be protected with snow fencing to the drip line during construction.
6. No grading is to take place within five feet of any property line, except as specified on the approved site plan.
7. If applicable, the applicant shall comply with the requirements of Section 21-25 of the Town of Orangetown Shade Tree Ordinance.
8. If applicable, the applicant shall comply with the Energy Star requirements, per the Town of Orangetown Building Department.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Paul Papay and seconded by James Dodge and carried as follows: Jack Messina, aye; James Dodge, aye; Dan Sherman, absent; Jill Fieldstein, aye; Michael Bosco, absent, Paul Papay, aye and Larry Vail, aye.

The Clerk to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this Decision and file a certified copy in the Office of the Town Clerk and the Office of the Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review.

**Dated: January 19, 2012
Town of Orangetown
Architecture and Community Appearance Board of Review**

