

**MINUTES
HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
MARCH 10, 2009**

MEMBERS PRESENT: William Walther
Thano Schoppel
Margaret Raso
Larry Bucciarelli

ABSENT: Henry Shrady
Scott Wheatley

ALSO PRESENT: Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide
Dennis Michaels, Deputy Town Attorney

Thano Schoppel, Chair, called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. Hearings on this meeting's agenda, which are made a part of this meeting, were held as noted below:

<u>APPLICANTS</u>	<u>DECISION</u>	<u>HABR #</u>
<u>CONTINUED ITEMS:</u>		
COMITO 78.13 / 2 / 3.3; R-40 zone	APPROVED AS MODIFIED	HABR#09-02
OUR LADY OF SACRED HEART CHURCH GAZEBO 77.11 / 1 / 11; R-15 zone	APPROVED AS MODIFIED	HABR#08-12
<u>NEW ITEMS:</u>		
KOHN 78.17 / 2 / 15.3; R-40 zone	RENOVATION TO HOUSE AND BARN STRUCTURE APPROVED AS MODIFIED/ APPLICANT MUST RETURN TO THE BOARD FOR COLOR APPROVAL FOR HOUSE AND BARN	HABR#09-03
CHILDREN'S ENRICHMENT CENTER SIGN 77.10 / 2 / 18; CS zone	APPROVED AS PRESENTED	HABR#09-04

OTHER BUSINESS:

HOOKER RESIDENCE temporary wheelchair access for property located at 41 Washington Spring Road, Palisades, N.Y. Section 78.19, Block 1, Lot 11; R-40 zone David Englander appeared and presented handwritten sketches showing the location of handicap ramps and a mechanical lift for ingress/egress to the Hooker residence and pictures of the changes in doors to accommodate a wheelchair; explaining the urgent need for these temporary structures; that all of the necessary ramps and railing will be built to match the existing house; and stating that when the applicant no longer needs wheelchair access or before the house is sold the ramps and mechanical lift will be removed.

William Walther made a motion to approve the temporary structures as presented with the condition that they will be removed when no longer needed or before the sale of the house; which motion was seconded by Margaret Raso; and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; William Walther, aye; Larry Bucciarelli, aye. Scott Wheatley and Henry Shrady were absent.

THE DECISIONS RELATED TO THE ABOVE HEARINGS are inserted herein and made part of these minutes.

There being no further business to come before the Board, on motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 9:30 P.M.

DATED: March 10, 2009

HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW

Deborah Arbolino
Administrative Aid

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
ASSESSOR
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
SUPERVISOR
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
BUILDING INSPECTOR (Individual Decisions)
DEPT. of ENVIRONMENTAL MGMT. and ENGINEERING

DECISION

APPROVED AS SUBMITTED

TO: Marc Comito
Comito Construction Co.
87 Sixth Avenue
Nyack, New York 10960

HABR # 09-02
February 10, 2009
March 10, 2009

FROM: HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR# 09-02: Application of Marc Comito for review of a proposed new single-family residence to be located at 3 Kopac Lane, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Palisades, New York. Chapter 12, Section 12-4(A), Historic Areas Board of Review. Tax Numbers: 78.13 / 1 / 3.3; R-40 zoning district.

Heard by the HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meetings held on the following Tuesdays, February 10, 2009 and March 10, 2009 at which time the Board made the following determination:

The applicant presented the following items for review:

1. Survey dated September 15, 2008 signed and sealed by John Atzl, L.S.
2. Architectural plans signed and sealed by Robert Hoene, Architect, dated 1/14/2009, (6 pages) with the latest revision date of 2/26/09.
3. A computer generated picture of the house with landscaping.

Jared Cohen, owner, Mark Comito, contractor and Robert Hoene, Architect, appeared.

Robert Hoene, Architect, stated that the proposal is for a new single-family residence; that the house will be all brick and the picture was submitted to show the color of the

proposed brick; that the house will have Pine Hall Brick in Chesapeake Pearl with Robinson Brick zone accents; that there will be a double sconce lighting above the front door; that they will try to make the brick darker if that is what the Board wants; and that he would like a continuance to bring back the changes the Board is asking for.

Marc Comito stated that the roof would be Tamko Brand Heritage 30, rustic black architectural shingles; that the shutters would be cedar dark brown; that the air conditioning units would be located on the rear exterior of the house and shielded with landscaping.

Jared Cohen stated that he is building a large beautiful house.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Margaret Hall, Palisades stated that the house is too big, larger than any other houses in the area.

Robert Exema, palisades, stated that he is surprised that the lots are being sold individually; that he is concerned with the size of the house and wanted to know if it fits with the zoning; and that if the house has to be that big, the applicant should build green.

Alice Gerard, Palisades, welcomed the applicants to the neighborhood.

Paul Papay stated that he is worried about future houses and what they will look like; that all of the houses should look different.

Carol Baxter stated that she is concerned that the houses should be built in size and materials that are harmonious with the other houses in the area; and that the applicant should keep in mind that they are building in the historic area.

At the meeting of March 10, 2009 Marc Comito and Robert Hoene, Architect, appeared.

Robert Hoene stated that they made substantial changes to the exterior of the house since the last meeting; that grilles were added to the front gable to match the picture that was submitted at the meeting; that on the right elevation gables were added with arched windows along with lights along the garage doors; that all of the windows have a brick trim; that the rear hip roofs that were part of the first submission for the great room and bathroom have been changed to gable roofs; that the windows for the family room were changed and decorative trim was added; that details for the fireplace have been added; that the bedroom windows have been centered; that the front and back door will have lighting; that the picture submitted of the landscape plan was done by Dan Sherman, a landscape Architect and is based on the landscape plan that was approved by ACABOR; and that the suggestions from the Board have made this a more attractive house.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing same, found as fact, that:

1. The application as presented would not adversely affect the Historic District and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the new residence are complimentary to the District.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, (Architectural plans signed and sealed by Robert Hoene, Architect with the latest revision date of February 26, 2009) the application is APPROVED as submitted and presented with the following conditions:

1. The roof shall be Tamko Heritage 30 Architectural style shingles in Rustic Black.

2. The exterior of the house shall be 4" white brick with white mortar on all sides with dark earth tone stone accents as per plan.
3. The soffits and fascia shall be white vinyl/aluminum.
4. The exterior doors shall be double Therma Tru brand stained mahogany style with ¾ light insert for the entry and Anderson Frenchwood sliding door with white exterior trim for the dinette.
5. The windows shall be Andersen brand, sizes as per plan; white exteriors, 400 series casements with grilles on all windows.
6. The shutters shall be Board and Batten painted/stained dark brown.
7. The gutters and leaders shall be white aluminum.
8. The garage doors shall be Clopay Coachmen carriage style with divided light windows.
9. The driveway will be macadam with Belgium block curb.
10. The front porch shall be bluestone with a limestone border; the steps shall be limestone treads and brick risers with a bluestone walkway.
11. There shall be two lights at the front door, three lights over the garage doors and one light at the rear door.

A motion to approve the application as submitted (Architectural plans signed and sealed by Robert Hoene, Architect with the latest revision date of February 26, 2009) was presented and moved by William Walther, seconded by Margaret Raso; and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; William Walther, aye; and Larry Bucciarelli, aye. Henry Shrady and Scott Wheatley were absent.

The Administrative Aid to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: March 10, 2009

HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT	TOWN CLERK
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS	HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
HABR MEMBERS	TOWN HISTORIAN
SUPERVISOR	DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
TOWN ATTORNEY	ENGINEERING
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY	HABR, PB, FILE
OBZPAE	PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN
BUILDING INSPECTOR- B,vW.	

DECISION

APPROVED AS CONDITIONED WITH FULL A FRAME ROOF THAT IS LEVEL WITH THE FLOOR OF THE GAZEBO

TO: Father George Torok
120 Kings Highway
Tappan, New York 10983

HABR # 08-12
March 10, 2009

FROM: HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR# 08-12: Application of Our Lady of Sacred Heart for review of an existing gazebo structure to be located at 120 Kings Highway, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Tappan, New York. Chapter 12, Section 12-4(A), Historic Areas Board of Review. Tax Numbers: 77.11 / 1 / 1; R-15 zoning district.

Heard by the HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at meetings held on the

following Tuesdays, December 9, 2008, January 13, 2009 and March 10, 2009 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Father John Dwyer appeared at the December 9, 2008 meeting.

The applicant presented the following:

1. Six pictures of the existing gazebo/pergola.
2. Drawing of proposed gazebo roof modification dated Feb. 2009 with cover letter.

Father Dwyer stated that the project originally started out to alleviate four years of putting together and taking apart a stable; that this structure was built to serve that purpose and have a grotto for prayer that can be used year round; that Lowe's designed the structure; that it is built with footings as a permanent structure; and that they would like a continuance to show alternate roof lines.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

John Appley, member of the church, asked if the structure could stay as built and could planting an aggressive vine like trumpet vine or wisteria be planted to grow over the roof?

At the January 13, 2009 meeting Father George and Stanley Kietur appeared.

Father George stated that the front portion of the roof is wider; that the structure is situated in front of the grotto; that if the roof were removed it would defeat the purpose of the structure because everything would be exposed to birds, seeds and droppings and render the structure useless.

Stanley Kietur stated that the building department told them to maintain the pergola; that they need a roof on the structure because of the pine trees and the droppings from them and the birds; and that they would like a continuance to come back with different roof styles.

The Board recommended the applicant come back with a drawing that could be approved and several members suggested a peaked roof.

At the March 10, 2009 meeting Stanley Kietur appeared.

Stanley Kietur stated that they would like to add a peaked roof in the center of the existing flat gazebo roof that would be four feet wide and three feet high; that the center of the peak facing the parking lot would have cross on it; that the sides and back would be finished with certain cedar impressions white roofing material; that the fascia board around the existing flat roof and the underneath side of the roof would also be finished in white trim; that the bottom of the gazebo would be finished with white privacy lattice; and that the grass area surrounding the gazebo will be re-seeded in the spring.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing same, found as fact, that:

1. The application as presented with modification would not adversely affect the Historic District and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed roof are complimentary to the District.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application (A full A Frame roof with a ridge height of 6' and 12' wide and the roof ridge must be

level with the floor of the gazebo) is APPROVED as submitted and presented with the following conditions:

1. The roof shall be a full A Frame roof with a 6' high ridge that sits level with the gazebo floor.
2. The width of the A-Frame shall be 12' wide and finished with Certainteed Cedar Impressions shingles in White.
3. The fascia Board of the gazebo shall be finished in white.
4. The bottom of the gazebo shall be finished with white privacy lattice to cover all mechanics.
5. The center peak of the roof facing the parking lot may have a cross on it.
6. The applicant shall submit revised plans showing the above modifications to the gazebo.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by William Walther, seconded by Larry Bucciarelli; and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; William Walther, aye; Larry Bucciarelli, aye. Scott Wheatley and Henry Shradly were absent.

The Administrative Aid to the Board is hear by authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: March 10, 2009

HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT	TOWN CLERK
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS	HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
HABR MEMBERS	TOWN HISTORIAN
SUPERVISOR	DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
TOWN ATTORNEY	ENGINEERING
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY	HABR, PB, FILE
OBZPAE	PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN
BUILDING INSPECTOR- J.P.	

DECISION

APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS; APPLICANT MUST RETURN TO THE BOARD AS "OTHER BUSINESS" FOR COLOR APPROVAL BEFORE PAINTING

TO: Eugene Kohn
P.O. Box 6
27 Heyhoe Woods Road
Palisades, New York 10964

HABR #09-03
March 10, 2009

FROM: HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR# 09-03: Application of Eugene Kohn for review of a proposed new barn/garage and alteration to the existing single family residence located at 27 HeyHoe Road, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Palisades, New York. Chapter 12, Section 12-4(A), Historic Areas Board of Review.

Tax Numbers: 78.17 / 2 / 15.3; R-40 zoning district.

Heard by the HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday,

March 10, 2009 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Eugene Kohn and Brandon Wagner appeared and testified.

The applicant presented the following:

1. Architectural plans dated 1/22/09 with a revision date of 1/28/09 signed and sealed by Jon Fellgraff, Architect (4 pages).
2. A computer generated picture of the existing house.
3. Page of stonecraft accessories.
4. Page of Barn Light electric.
5. Copy of survey dated September 16, 1999 by Robert Sorace, PLS.

Eugene Kohn stated that he has owned the house for a little over one year; that it was built seven or eight years ago; that it looks like they started out building a contemporary style house and somewhere along the way it became mismatched in its appearance; that he wants to try to give it a little style; that he wants to remove the large rounded window and add shutters and mullions to the windows; that he would also like to construct the barn to use as a garage for the cars and for storage; that he would like to use Board and Batten instead of the texture 111 if the cost is not exorbitant; that he is proposing to paint the cedar on the house China White with a different white color trim and add shutters painted Benjamin Moore Essex Green, which is like a hunter green; that he planned on painting the barn a different shade of white; and using 150 year old barn windows that he is refurbishing; that the doors would like barn doors but would open automatically; that he originally was planning on using barn doors that open out but was talked out of it by the architect because they are not practical; that he would lose his view of the woods from the kitchen and living areas if the barn was moved to the rear of the lot; that the house is set back 150 feet from the road; that the garage is placed at the required 30 foot side yard; that he is planning to add a circular drive that would meet the garage; and that he would appreciate being able to get an approval for construction and would return to the Board for color approval..

Brandon Wagner stated that he is originally from New Orleans; that he has experience with historic structures; that China White is a historic color; that the combination of China White with a white trim and dark green shutters is very attractive; that this combination will look very good with the green roof; and that changing the color of the barn would be possible but he would really like to keep the house China White.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Rex Lalire, an abutting property owner, stated that he is an architect and that he has a few suggestions; that the relationship between the barn and the house and the house should be shown on the plan; that he is concerned that the placement of the barn in front of the house would dominate the property; that historically barns are behind the house not in front of it; that the Board and Batten would look much better than the texture 111; that it can be purchased upstate for a minimal difference in price; that if the house is white the barn should be different color; and that a more subdued color that blends into the woods would be his suggestion.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing same, found as fact, that:

1. The application as presented with modification would not adversely affect the Historic District and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed renovation to the house and the proposed barn are complimentary to the District.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application (Architectural plans dated 1/22/09 with a revision date of 1/28/09 signed and sealed by Jon Fellgraff, Architect (4 pages) is APPROVED with Board & Batten in place of all Texture 111 and with Pennsylvania Rock instead of River Rock) and presented with the following conditions:

1. The roof of the proposed barn shall match the existing roof on the house.
2. The applicant has agreed to the use of Board & Batten instead of Texture 111 on the proposed barn.
3. The applicant has the choice of using Board & Batten with Pennsylvania stone or Board & Batten from the ground up without any stone on the proposed barn.
4. The applicant will return to the Board as "other business" to determine the color of the house and the proposed barn.
5. The house shall be renovated according to the plan submitted (Page A-2).

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Larry Bucciarelli, seconded by William Walther; and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; William Walther, aye; Larry Bucciarelli, aye. Scott Wheatley and Henry Shrady were absent.

The Administrative Aid to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: March 10, 2009

HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR-J.P.

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

DECISION

SIGN APPROVED

TO: Amy Covino (Children's Enrichment Sign)
49 Van Terrace
Sparkill, New York 10976

HABR #09-04
March 10, 2009

FROM: HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW, TOWN OF ORANGETOWN

HABR# 09-04: Application of Children's Enrichment Center for review of a proposed sign to be located at the Tappan Reformed Church, 32 Old Tappan Road, in the Town of Orangetown, Hamlet of Tappan, New York. Chapter 12, Section 12-4(A), Historic Areas Board of Review.

Tax Numbers: 77.10 / 2 / 18; CS zoning district.

Heard by the HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW at a meeting held on Tuesday, March 10, 2009 at which time the Board made the following determination:

Amy Covino appeared and testified.

The applicant presented the following:

1. Tax map site plan showing the placement of the proposed sign.
2. Computer generated picture of the lettering for the proposed sign.
3. Sketch of the proposed sign and posts with color swatches attached.

Amy Covino stated that the sign would be maple two sided painted Valspar Homestead Resort Moss with the lettering painted Valspar American Tradition Raspberry Wine with the posts being painted Valspar Saffron Ivory; and that the portion of the sign with the phone number will hand from the main sign with chains.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Board, after personal observation of the property, hearing all the testimony and reviewing same, found as fact, that:

1. The application as presented would not adversely affect the Historic District and the surrounding area. The design and materials for the proposed sign are complimentary to the District.

DECISION: In view of the foregoing and the testimony before the Board, the application for the proposed maple sign is APPROVED as submitted and presented with the following conditions:

1. The sign will be a maple two sided sign painted Valspar Homestead Resort Moss with the lettering painted Valspar American Tradition Raspberry Wine
2. The posts for the sign shall be painted Valspar Saffron Ivory.
3. The portion of the sign with the phone number will hand from the main sign with chains and be painted to match the main sign.

The foregoing resolution was presented and moved by Margaret Raso, seconded by William Walther; and carried as follows: Thano Schoppel, aye; Margaret Raso, aye; William Walther, aye; and Larry Bucciarelli, aye. Scott Wheatley and Henry Shradly were absent.

The Administrative Aid to the Board is hereby authorized, directed and empowered to sign this decision and file a certified copy thereof in the office of the Town Clerk.

Dated: March 10, 2009

HISTORIC AREAS BOARD OF REVIEW
TOWN OF ORANGETOWN
Deborah Arbolino, Administrative Aide

DISTRIBUTION:

APPLICANT
TOWN BOARD MEMBERS
HABR MEMBERS
SUPERVISOR
TOWN ATTORNEY
DEPUTY TOWN ATTORNEY
OBZPAE
BUILDING INSPECTOR- L.P.

TOWN CLERK
HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT
TOWN HISTORIAN
DEPT. OF ENVIRONMENTAL
ENGINEERING
HABR, PB, FILE
PB, ZBA, ACABOR CHAIRMAN

